



Reinvent Albany.

Opening New York

Technology and Open Government

March 18, 2014

About Reinvent Albany

Reinvent Albany promotes open, accountable New York State government. We seek a state government that is clear and honest about its goals and activities, keeps its promises, and benefits from the collective genius and participation of New Yorkers. Our interest in government transparency and public participation is both practical and idealistic. Around the world, the governments that are the most effective and least corrupt are also the most transparent and accountable.

We strongly support the work of New Yorkers advocating for more ethical and fairer government. We share many of their goals. However, we also bring some new and different perspectives. We are particularly interested in the power of Information Technology to make our state government more responsive, open and effective. This technology — which includes the wireless internet, smart phones, social media, and open source “apps” development — is changing everyday life, and has the potential to strengthen our democracy and greatly improve our state government. Many of our initiatives propose using Information Technology to make Albany more understandable and cost effective.

Executive Summary

Opening up New York State government’s vast compendium of information requires two things. First, the massive amount of information that is already online needs to be easy to find and use. Second, information that is crucial to the integrity and function of our democracy needs to be disclosed via new laws and rules and made available online.

While Reinvent Albany is extremely concerned by the lack of transparency surrounding public subsidies, tax credits, state sub-contractors, lump sum/MOU budgeted projects, local IDAs and LDCs, public authorities, and non-profit organization reporting, we do not believe this forum is the right place to win new reporting and disclosure requirements. Accordingly, we are focusing here solely on the question of how to get state government data that is already online made more useful to the public and to government.

Leading on Open Data, Lagging on Overall Openness.

New York State government has done a good job using websites and new technology to make government data and information more easily available to the public. Indeed, New York has some of the best open data and government transparency websites in the country, and perhaps the world.

Unfortunately, despite rapid progress, open data or “open government” practices remain the exception rather than the rule within state agencies, the legislature, and other branches of government; the vast bulk of state data that could be open is not. Additionally, state agencies do a poor job of collating and analyzing what information the public and other government agencies are seeking, and publishing that information.

“New York has some of the best open data and government transparency websites in the country.”

Recommendations

The good news is that New York State government can make rapid and inexpensive progress making vast amounts of important digital information easier to find and use by doing five things:

1. Methodically assess the information the public and other agencies are seeking via website use, call center requests, paper forms, transactions, and FOIL disclosure requests; make that information public the way 311 systems do.
2. Publish an open government handbook of best practices; agencies should implement consistent open data principles by making data internet searchable, open format, machine readable, and downloadable. Create an online dashboard to report on agency adoption of these practices, like ITS' Empire 2.0 social media initiative.
3. Create an open statewide database of map and geospatial data as Massachusetts has done with MassGIS. NYS geospatial data is scattered and access-restricted.
4. Use public APIs (Application Programming Interfaces) to hugely increase data sharing between databases maintained by different state offices and levels of government.
5. Track and publicize open data success stories.

New York Among the Best Open Data & Transparency Sites

New York State has four premier open government websites: the governor's "Open NY" open data and Open Budget NY sites; the Comptroller's "Open Book"; and the Attorney General's New York Open Government (NYOG). The Senate's site has a public API for accessing bill language and legislation, but the Assembly's site is antiquated. No state site (whether Senate or Assembly) makes the laws of New York available via an API.

In 2013, Governor Cuomo established the Open NY open data initiative via Executive Order 95. In this short time, Open NY has achieved significant success. New York's open data efforts like the MTA's real-time data feeds and the Health Department's "Health Data NY" are considered national best practices. Better yet, Open NY is led and advised by nationally recognized specialists in open data, and continues to evolve.

The governor has also forged new ground with his Open Budget NY website, which includes a wealth of machine-readable budget documents from past and proposed budgets; it could be the best budget transparency site of any state or city. (By comparison, New York City does not have a machine-readable budget.)

New York's other statewide officials also have some of the best transparency websites and data reporting in the U.S.

The attorney general's New York Open Government has a powerful single-search feature that brings together results from multiple databases, and the Comptroller's Open Book NY site includes easily accessible data on state contracts and spending. Additionally, the Comptroller has a large team working hard to develop additional features and open much-sought public authority data. All of these premier sites follow the best practice of allowing users to download their search results in spreadsheets or bulk downloads, and the state's open data site provides a public API for every data set it hosts.

Open government best practices are starting to spread among state agencies. For instance, the Department of Tax and Finance publishes a downloadable, spreadsheet file with any narrative document which contains large amounts of tabular data. Likewise, the Division of Criminal Justice publishes crime statistics in both PDF and CSV formats.

Challenges

New York has much to be proud of, but there is clearly still an enormous amount of work to do. Reinvent Albany conducted "Agency Openness Assessments" on fourteen major state agencies and authorities; we found that few proactively disclosed information which was easy to find or use. Agencies and authorities still provide almost all of their tabular data in a PDF format which is not usable in a spreadsheet. Public watchdogs consider this "hiding in plain sight" since it is very difficult to evaluate hundreds of pages of charts and tabular data by hand.

"New York has much to be proud of, but there is clearly still an enormous amount of work to do."

Agencies also restrict public access to large agency databases by using online forms that produce limited and non-downloadable search results. DEC in particular keeps huge amounts of high demand data behind online search boxes. The real world result of this practice is that watchdogs and journalists spend time and money "scraping" hundreds of pages PDF documents out of those search boxes to get the data they want into a machine readable format they can use. Or, as an alternative to scraping, the public FOILs the data and requests its disclosure in a machine readable format.

Recommendations for New York Open Government

1. Identify the Digital Information Key Stakeholders Want

The governor's office needs to instruct agencies to collect, analyze, and share the following information – which they should be collecting anyway to improve their operations – with stakeholders in and out of government want.

- Web analytics – what pages are being looked at, what forms are being downloaded, what data is being searched for?
- Analyze FOIL requests – is FOILED information in databases which can be exposed?
- Call center requests – what are people asking for on the phone?
- Paper form and permit submissions.

Additionally, other agencies should convene and consult key stakeholders about what data they want, as DOH has. Web analytics, FOIL requests and call center information should be made public as NYC has done with 311 complaints.

2. Publish a Handbook of Open Data Best Practices for all Agencies

Open NY should issue an open government technical standards and best practices manual for agency management and employees:

- Agency web pages should link to their data on data.NY.gov / OpenNY
- Agency sites should have a “downloadable data” page and directory of links to downloadable datasets on their own sites.
- Agency sites should provide machine-readable downloads of tabular information to accompany narrative reports. (The Tax Department and the Division of Budget both do this.)
- ITS should create a public dashboard to track agency compliance with these best practices, akin to the Empire 2.0 social media initiative.

3. Open Maps: Make Geospatial Data Available in Open Formats

The state's geospatial data is dispersed, unlinked and hard to find. The vast bulk of geospatial data requires registration. Geospatial data should be indexed in one location per MassGIS, and should be available without restrictions.

4. Use Public Web APIs for Interagency Data Sharing

Data on the Comptroller's Open Book website and the Attorney General's NYOG website, and other large data sources, could be made available via public web API for easier use by other parts and levels of government, as well as the public. APIs for automatically updating data, including upcoming public meeting and hearing schedules, would allow unrestricted development of mobile apps.

5. Track and publicize open data success stories.

The MTA's Developer portal¹ lists third-party apps powered by the authority's data; as of 2014, there are 78 on the site, and more are released every month. The NYC Open Data initiative keeps a blog² of notable apps which make use of public data.

¹ See: <http://www.mta.info/developers/index.html>

² Available at: <http://nycopendata.tumblr.com/>

Open Government Best Practices For New York

According to the New York State’s Freedom of Information Law, state government information is open and available to the public, unless there is a clear reason that information can’t be shared because of concerns over privacy, security, or intellectual property. The advent of inexpensive computing power and speedy networking, as well as the convergence of the internet and mobile platforms, combined with the proliferation of Application Programming Interfaces (APIs), has made it profoundly easier and less expensive to share this government information.

“Current open government best practices incorporate changes in new technology.”

Broadly, current open government best practices incorporate changes in new technology; they ask government agencies to publish information about what they know and do online in an open, unrestricted digital format that can be used by the general public. This data should be usable by common software or devices. Intrinsic to open government is the idea that digital information should be:

- Easy to find with an Internet search engine.
- Viewable and downloadable without registration or other restriction.
- Open format (CSV, Excel, KML, Shapefile, GeoJSON etc.)
- Machine readable – usable in spreadsheets, mapping software.
- Available as a bulk download or via API for use with other large data sets.
- Includes metadata that includes creation date, update schedule, data owner and more.

Examples of Best Practices

1. Tabular data (charts and tables) are in a downloadable CSV or Excel format.

Data that is included as part of a large narrative document, like a report or budget, should be available for download as a CSV or Excel file, like New York's Executive Budget.³

The Department of Taxation and Finance provides tabular data in a downloadable Excel-format file alongside hundreds of its own PDF reports. The Excel file contains a table of contents, a legend, and a separate page for each chart appearing in the report. Each page has both the chart/graph and the tabular information represented by that chart/graph.⁴ This is the single most complete view of data in any report published by any agency in this state.

2. Geospatial Data and Online Maps

Maps are one of the best ways of displaying large amounts of data. Unfortunately, New York's map and geospatial data is hard to find and use. New York's maps and geospatial data are scattered and often restricted.

LAMP / State Liquor Authority

One of the State's best online maps is the State Liquor Authority's interactive LAMP,⁵ which displays the status of all liquor licenses and violations. This site is heavily used by community groups and government officials, and displays a huge amount of data in an economical way.

MassGIS

The Massachusetts Information Technology Division (their ITS) maintains a comprehensive statewide database of state geospatial information. In 2010, a new law established MassGIS, a single GIS database for Massachusetts. Much like

³ For example: <http://openbudget.ny.gov/historicalFP/fy1415archive/eBudget1415/fpTables/ExecutiveFY2015update.xlsx>

⁴ For example: http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/collections/fy_collections_stat_report/2012_13_annual_statistical_report_of_ny_state_tax_collections.htm

⁵ Available at <http://lamp.sla.ny.gov/nysla/index.htm>

New York State's Executive Order 95, the law coordinated all GIS activity statewide, and tasked the ITD with promulgating technical standards for geographic data.

Today, MassGIS has hundreds of datasets available to search and download; users who prefer to view the maps online can use "OLIVER," an interactive query tool which overlays state data on a variety of base maps. Massachusetts has built and continues to support MassGIS with the goal of powering the next generation of 911 emergency systems with the state's own open data.

Further, Massachusetts believes they've saved millions of dollars by sharing GIS data with local governments, who would otherwise have to engineer ad hoc knowledge-sharing solutions or research best practices. By removing the potential for its localities to duplicate efforts, Massachusetts saves time and money.

3. Downloadable Searches and Bulk Downloads of Databases

The Comptrollers OpenBook NY site and the Attorney General's NY Open Government sites allow users to either search an online database and download the search results as a spreadsheet or to download an entire database. This is a very powerful and flexible feature, and it maximizes the value of the web site to the user by making the data much easier to search and use.

4. "Single Box Search" and Aggregate Results Page

The attorney general's NYOG website includes an extremely powerful search feature which allows the user to enter the name of a person, non-profit group or private business and receive a summary of search results from data from the Board of Elections, Comptroller, Joint Committee on Ethics and AG's office. This allows a user to see political giving, lobbying, contracts, and other information at a glance.

5. APIs

An Application Programming Interface or API, is code that tells software how to interact with other software. A public API allows developers to "stream" data straight from a state database to their website or mobile application. Public APIs let databases "talk" to each other without special agreements, and would be an

easy way for agencies to share data between levels of government or elected offices.

Open NY / Data.NY.Gov's Socrata powered open data portal automatically writes an API to all of the data sets hosted on it. It is one of most powerful features of the Open NY site, but yet to be heavily used by apps developers, researchers or other government entities.

The Metropolitan Transit Authority is a best practice for providing application programming interfaces (APIs) to the public. Programmers use APIs to pipe the latest data straight from MTA servers to applications. The MTA provides plenty of other resources for developers interested in creating applications referring to or powered by MTA data. The MTA has data on the NYC Open Data portal, it also maintains its own developer portal⁶ with helpful resources for anyone looking to build on the MTA's data. Further, the agency has opened up its transit data through a specialized real-time data feed;⁷ there are dozens of separate APIs.

Just five years ago, the MTA sued apps developers who manually copied data from paper schedules.⁸

⁶ Available at: <http://www.mta.info/developers/index.html>

⁷ Here: <http://datamine.mta.info>

⁸ "New York MTA threatens blogger, asserts copyright over schedule" *Greater Greater Washington*, August 19, 2009: <http://greatergreaterwashington.org/post/3263/new-york-mta-threatens-blogger-asserts-copyright-over-schedule/>

Openness Assessments

Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA)

Does the agency have a large amount of discrete data online in document format?

Yes. Very large amount.

Is there an agency directory of downloadable or other data sets?

Yes, there is a very large amount of data to work with.⁹ Each dataset has a last updated date. Metadata is not consistent, but authorship information is included. The agency is also very friendly to developers and even has a “Developer Resources” page.¹⁰

Is there a “Transparency page?”

Yes. it includes mainly pdf documents of agency budget and financial information

Open data available via agency site?

Extensive transit travel time data is available via GTFS data feed to developers, powering numerous travel apps for public.¹¹

Open data available via data.ny.gov?

Yes, approximately a dozen data sets including subway fare card usage, MTA bridge usage, etc.

Are there links to Open NY / data.ny.gov on the agency site?

No

⁹ Available at: <http://www.mta.info/developers/download.html>

¹⁰ See: <http://www.mta.info/developers/index.html>

¹¹ See: <http://datamine.mta.info/>

Machine readable, downloadable files for tabular data within narrative documents?

No

Are there links to Maps and GIS Layers?

There are no downloadable shapefiles. However, much of the CSV data is geocoded by location.

High value data not available to public in machine readable or downloadable form:

1. Transit Alerts: The available digital archive of real-time "transit alerts" sent by email or text by the MTA to alert riders with information on specific delays.
2. Incidents: The available digital archive of complaints and incidents (without personal identification.)
3. Service Diversions: Upcoming and real-time weekend service diversion information.
4. Lost and Found: The number of items found and claimed losses (without identification) in the MTA New York City Transit "lost and found" database.
5. Polls: Current and ongoing rider opinion polls and surveys about quality of service.
6. PES: While some performance measures are available on MTA State, the entire Passenger Environment Survey should be available as data on the developers resource

Are agency budget, financials, project lists and capital projects available as open data?

No. Large number of pdf documents with extensive tables available only as pdf.

Public meetings: calendar, meeting resources, webcasts

- Schedule or calendar of public events or meetings: Yes
- Is the schedule/calendar downloadable: No
- Are meeting minutes archived? How long? Downloadable?
- Are meeting briefing materials available? Yes.
- Machine readable? No.
- Are meetings webcast: Yes
- Are webcasts archived: Yes

- Are webcast transcripts available: No

FOIL Requests

- Are FOIL requests and/or responses public: No
- Are FOIL requests publicly tracked: No
- Is there an online FOIL form: Yes

Are FAQs posted?

Effectively yes via extensive customer service information.

Department of Environmental Conservation

Summary

Should be considered a top candidate for an open data treatment. Thousands upon thousands of reports, maps, and data sets locked away in PDF reports, restricted search queries, and other information silos. Historical data going back decades is useless. If it's sharing information internally, it's using a format other than PDF; in that case, that data ought to be online. The Chemical and Pollution Control division want to use information from the Lands and Waters division?

Does the agency have a large amount of discrete data online in document format?

Yes. Hundreds or thousands of reports.

Is there an agency directory of downloadable or other data sets?

No. They're scattered across the DEC site.

Is there a "Transparency page?"

No.

Open data available via agency site?

Yes, some through bulk download, some via restricted search, and some data in PDF tables.

Open data available via data.ny.gov?

Just 24 datasets out of thousands.¹²

Are there links to Open NY / data.ny.gov on the agency site?

No.

Machine readable, downloadable files for tabular data within narrative documents?

No.

Are there links to Maps and GIS Layers?

Too many to list: Biome/Habitat, Superfund Sites, Emission Sources, Solid Waste Management Sites, Power Plants, Protected Natural Resources, Mineral Resources, Stormwater Mapping, etc.¹³

Note that many of these are not available for download or reuse, and instead are accessible via a series of custom-built interactive maps with extremely limited functionality.

High value data not available to public in machine readable or downloadable form:

Restricted Search

1. Spill Incidents: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/cfm/EXTAPPS/DEREXTERNAL/index.cfm?pageid=2>
2. Remedial Sites: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/cfm/EXTAPPS/DEREXTERNAL/index.cfm?pageid=3>
3. Bulk Storage Facilities: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/cfm/EXTAPPS/DEREXTERNAL/index.cfm?pageid=4>
4. Rare Plants and Rare Animals: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/imsmaps/ERM/viewer.htm>

¹² Available at: https://data.ny.gov/browse?Dataset-Information_Agency=Environmental+Conservation%2C+Department

¹³ See: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/pubs/212.html> and <http://www.dec.ny.gov/pubs/42937.html>

PDF Tables

1. Macroinvertebrate Data Reports, e.g.: http://www.dec.ny.gov/docs/water_pdf/barcohoctono4b.pdf
2. Wastewater Treatment Plants: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/chemical/8721.html>
3. Rare Animal Status Inventory List: http://www.dec.ny.gov/docs/wildlife_pdf/rareanimalstatuslist.pdf
4. Trapping Harvest Data: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/outdoor/93855.html>
5. Fisheries Annual Reports, e.g.: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/outdoor/27068.html>
6. Hazardous Waste Generation: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/chemical/81881.html>
7. Oil, Gas, and Mineral Resources Annual Reports: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/pubs/36033.html>
8. Map of Municipal Wastewater Treatment Plants in NYS: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/chemical/48871.html>
9. Wastewater Infrastructure Needs of NYS: http://www.dec.ny.gov/docs/water_pdf/infrastructure_rpt.pdf
10. Water Reports by County: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/lands/77821.html>

Are agency budget, financials, project lists and capital projects available as open data?

No.

Public meetings: calendar, meeting resources, webcast

- Schedule or calendar of public events or meetings: Yes.¹⁴
- Is the schedule/calendar downloadable: No.
- Are meeting minutes archived? How long? Downloadable? For years.¹⁵
- Are meeting briefing materials available? Yes.
- Machine readable? Some.
- Archived? Yes.
- Are meetings webcast: Yes.¹⁶
- Are webcasts archived: No
- Are webcast transcripts available: No

¹⁴ At: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/calendar/>

¹⁵ See: <http://search.usa.gov/search?affiliate=nysdec&query=minutes>

¹⁶ Available at: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/public/36245.html>

FOIL

- Are FOIL requests and/or responses public: No.
- Are FOIL requests publicly tracked: No.
- Is there an online FOIL form: No.

Are FAQs posted?

Yes: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/public/373.html>

State Education Department

Summary

The number two candidate for a coordinated open data campaign. Currently provides zero data sets to OpenNY. The department web site is full of hundreds or even thousands of data sets siloed away in PDF formats and restricted search queries. Has an Information Reporting Service which publishes millions of pages of data in PDF format. Data on virtually everything NYS schools do is here, but none of it is actually usable.

Does the agency have a large amount of discrete data online in document format?

Yes. Hundreds or thousands of reports in PDF.

Is there an agency directory of downloadable or other data sets?

No.

Is there a "Transparency page?"

No, but there is an Information and Reporting Services division.¹⁷

Open data available via agency site?

Some spreadsheets, but almost all data is closed in PDF or HTML tables.

¹⁷ See: <http://www.p12.nysed.gov/irs/>

Open data available via data.ny.gov?

None.

Are there links to Open NY / data.ny.gov on the agency site?

No.

Machine readable, downloadable files for tabular data within narrative documents?

No.

Are there links to Maps and GIS Layers?

None.

High value data not available to public in machine readable or downloadable form:.

Restricted Search:

1. State Aid by School District: https://stateaid.nysed.gov/output_reports.htm
2. Special Education School District Data Profile: <http://eservices.nysed.gov/sepubrep/>

PDF/HTML Tables:

1. State and District Data Summaries of Special Education Data: <http://www.p12.nysed.gov/sedcar/state.htm>
2. Special Education Data Collection: <http://www.p12.nysed.gov/sedcar/>
3. District Total Cohort Graduation Rates by Disability, Economic Status, Gender, LEP, Race/Ethnicity, etc.: <http://www.p12.nysed.gov/irs/arra/home.html>
4. School Total Cohort Graduation Rates by Disability, Economic Status, Gender, LEP, Race/Ethnicity, etc.: <http://www.p12.nysed.gov/irs/arra/home.html>
5. Teacher Certification Examinations Pass Rate Data: <http://www.highered.nysed.gov/ocue/TitleIIData/>
6. Regents State Aid Proposal: <http://www.p12.nysed.gov/stateaidworkgroup/>
7. Admissions of First Time Applications to College: http://www.highered.nysed.gov/oris/admissions/AdmissionsByRace_EthnicityNYS.html

and http://www.highered.nysed.gov/oris/admissions/Admission-sSharesByRace_EthnicityNYS.html

8. Dozens of Education Statistics for New York State: <http://www.p12.nysed.gov/irs/statistics/public/home.html>
9. Distribution of High School Graduates and College Going Rate: <http://www.p12.nysed.gov/irs/statistics/hsgrads/home.html>
10. New York State School Report Cards: <https://reportcards.nysed.gov/>¹⁸
11. State class size data: <http://www.p12.nysed.gov/irs/pmf/2011-12/home.html>
12. Demographic data like free lunch status, special ed status, suspension rates, teacher and student attrition rates; some of this is available for some schools in their report cards,¹⁹ but it's incomplete and presented as a series of PDFs.

Are agency budget, financials, project lists and capital projects available as open data?

No. Budget information is presented in a PDF: <http://www.oms.nysed.gov/budget/monthfiscalreps.htm> and Capital Projects is all HTML: http://www.oms.nysed.gov/budget/bud2009-10/capital_const.htm

Public meetings: calendar, meeting resources, webcasts

- Schedule or calendar of public events or meetings: No.
- Is the schedule/calendar downloadable: No.
- Are meeting minutes archived? How long? Downloadable? Some.²⁰
- Are meeting briefing materials available? Unknown; not centralized.
- Machine readable? N/A.
- Archived? N/A.
- Are meetings webcast: Only Regents Meetings.²¹
- Are webcasts archived: Only most recent.
- Are webcast transcripts available: No.

¹⁸ Example: <https://reportcards.nysed.gov/schools.php?district=800000055103&year=2012>

¹⁹ Which are viewable at: <https://reportcards.nysed.gov/counties.php?year=2011>

²⁰ See: http://www.highered.nysed.gov/tcert/resteachers/standardboard_meetmin.html and <http://www.p12.nysed.gov/specialed/cap/minutes/nov2013.htm>

²¹ At: <http://usny.nysed.gov/webcasts.html>

FOIL

- Are FOIL requests and/or responses public: No.
- Are FOIL requests publicly tracked: No.
- Is there an online FOIL form: No.

Are FAQs posted?

No.

Empire State Development Corporation

Summary

Not as much data online as other agencies; certainly oversees significant development and tracks money flowing to capital projects. Should make an effort to provide more information in a central location on web site, and improve search feature of web site.

The few reporting documents online are in a format that cannot be searched or found via an internet search, or even a search within ESD's own website, and cannot be found by searching for key words; they're hiding in plain sight. Users cannot search for the name of an official or business or project within a document.

Does the agency have a large amount of discrete data online in document format?

No.

Is there an agency directory of downloadable or other data sets?

No.

Is there a "Transparency page?"

No.

Open data available via agency site?

No.

Open data available via data.ny.gov?

Ten datasets.²²

Are there links to Open NY / data.ny.gov on the agency site?

No.

Machine readable, downloadable files for tabular data within narrative documents?

No.

Are there links to Maps and GIS Layers?

None.

High value data not available to public in machine readable or downloadable form:.

1. Minority & Women's Business Development Reports: <http://www.empire.state.ny.us/MWBE/Data/2013AnnualReport.pdf>
2. Excelsior Jobs Program Reports: http://esd.ny.gov/CorporateInformation/Data/RequiredPostings/2013/ChartA_BusinessesAdmittedtoProgram12312013.pdf
3. Annual Report on Procurement Contracts: http://esd.ny.gov/Reports/AnnualProcurementContracts_FisicalYear2011.pdf
4. Annual Report on Jobs Created and Retained: http://esd.ny.gov/Reports/AnnualReportofEmployment2011Final_121411.pdf
5. Annual Program Report: http://esd.ny.gov/Reports/AnnualReportFY_2010-2011.pdf
6. Moynihan Station Development Corporation Draft Environmental Impact Statement: http://esd.ny.gov/subsidiaries_projects/msdc/msdcdeis.html
7. Atlantic Yards Environmental Impact Statements: http://esd.ny.gov/Subsidiaries_Projects/AYP/AY_FEIS.html
8. Grants like the Aqueduct Gaming Facility Capital Construction Grant: http://esd.ny.gov/Subsidiaries_Projects/Data/Aqueduct/101118_AqueductGPP.pdf

²² See: https://data.ny.gov/browse?Dataset-Information_Agency=Empire+State+Development

Are agency budget, financials, project lists and capital projects available as open data?

No. What budget documents exist are in closed formats, e.g.: <http://esd.ny.gov/corporateinformation/data/financialdocuments/esdcbudgetmaterials2011.pdf>

Public meetings: calendar, meeting resources, webcast

- Schedule or calendar of public events or meetings: Yes.²³
- Is the schedule/calendar downloadable: No.
- Are meeting minutes archived? Years of agendas, but not minutes.²⁴
- Are meeting briefing materials available? Yes.
- Machine readable? No.
- Archived? No.
- Are meetings webcast: Yes.
- Are webcasts archived: Six years and counting. <http://esd.ny.gov/webcasts/default.asp>
- Are webcast transcripts available: No. Some have captions.

FOIL

- Are FOIL requests and/or responses public: No.
- Are FOIL requests publicly tracked: No.
- Is there an online FOIL form: No.

Are FAQs posted?

No.

Port Authority

Summary

The best practice in New York State for FOIL: publicly released an archive of hundreds of FOIL requests, the responses, and all records released for that request. None of the requests nor responses are machine readable, but they do have

²³ At http://esd.ny.gov/PublicMeetings_Notices.html

²⁴ See: http://esd.ny.gov/PublicMeetings_Notices/PublicMeetings_Archives.html

lengthy descriptions. As such, the archive is virtually useless for meaningful analysis, but makes for interesting casual browsing.

Port Authority is also unique in its use of Granicus²⁵ to archive and transcribe webcast meetings. This software provides a permanent repository for streaming videos, but also creates a fully searchable transcription for each video. Users can read through the transcript, click on a sentence, and instantly skip to the portion of the meeting where that sentence was uttered.

Does the agency have a large amount of discrete data online in document format?

Yes.

Is there an agency directory of downloadable or other data sets?

No.

Is there a “Transparency page?”

Yes.²⁶

Open data available via agency site?

Yes.

Open data available via data.ny.gov?

18 Datasets.²⁷

Are there links to Open NY / data.ny.gov on the agency site?

No.

Machine readable, downloadable files for tabular data within narrative documents?

No.

²⁵ A provider of cloud-based web applications for government agencies. Los Angeles and New Orleans are among their thousands of customers.

²⁶ At: <http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/transparency.html>

²⁷ Available at: https://data.ny.gov/browse?Dataset-Information_Agency=Port+Authority+of+New+York+and+New+Jersey

Are there links to Maps and GIS Layers?

None.

High value data not available to public in machine readable or downloadable form:.

Data in Tables:

1. Employee Overtime Hours: <http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/employee-overtime-hours.html>
2. Claims For/Against Port Authority: <http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/business-transactions.html>
3. Insurance Premiums: <http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/business-transactions-insurance-2012.html>
4. Operating Budget Tables: <http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/budget-ctal-plan.html>
5. Capital Plan Tables: <http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/budget-ctal-plan.html>

Are agency budget, financials, project lists and capital projects available as open data?

No. Only available in PDF.²⁸

Public meetings: calendar, meeting resources, webcast

- Schedule or calendar of public events or meetings: Yes.²⁹
- Is the schedule/calendar downloadable: PDF only.
- Are meeting minutes archived? How long? Downloadable? Yes; since 2001.³⁰
- Are meeting briefing materials available? No.
- Machine readable? N/A.
- Archived? No.
- Are meetings webcast: Yes
- Are webcasts archived: Yes. Using Granicus.³¹

²⁸ See: <http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/budget-capital-plan.html>

²⁹ Here: <http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/committee-meeting-schedule.html>

³⁰ Available at: <http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/board-minutes-contract-authorizations.html>

³¹ Example: <http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/board-committee-meeting-videos.html>

- Are webcast transcripts available: Yes, for Tolls and Fares public hearings³² and for Board / Committee Meetings.³³

FOIL

- Are FOIL requests and/or responses public: Yes. A best practice in New York.³⁴
- Are FOIL requests publicly tracked: No.
- Is there an online FOIL form: Yes.³⁵

Are FAQs posted?

Yes.³⁶

Power Authority

Summary

Tons of financial information closed in PDFs. Information about electrical grid is also in PDFs. No open data in machine-readable formats anywhere on the site.

Does the agency have a large amount of discrete data online in document format?

Yes. Many reports online at the Documents & Reports page.³⁷

Is there an agency directory of downloadable or other data sets?

No.

³² At : <http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/public-hearing-transcripts-tolls-fares.html>

³³ At: <http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/board-committee-meeting-videos.html>

³⁴ See: <http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/freedom-information-requests.html>

³⁵ Here: <http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/foi-request.cfm>

³⁶ Available here: <http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/freedom-information-faqs.html>

³⁷ Here: <http://www.nypa.gov/about/documents.htm>

Is there a “Transparency page?”

There’s a page with reports, but there’s no open data.

Open data available via agency site?

No. All data is in PDFs.

Open data available via data.ny.gov?

Four sets.³⁸

Are there links to Open NY / data.ny.gov on the agency site?

No.

Machine readable, downloadable files for tabular data within narrative documents?

No.

Are there links to Maps and GIS Layers?

None.

High value data not available to public in machine readable or downloadable form:.

PDF/HTML Tables

1. Annual Budget/Financial Report: <http://www.nypa.gov/about/documents/Financials2012.pdf>
2. Financial Information: <http://www.nypa.gov/financial/default.htm>
3. Net Income – Actual vs. Budgeted: <http://www.nypa.gov/about/documents/actualversusBudgetNetIncome.pdf>
4. Projects Undertaken in Last Year: <http://www.nypa.gov/about/documents/2012Projects.pdf>
5. Debt Issuance Schedule: <http://www.nypa.gov/about/documents/DebtIssuanceSchedule2012.pdf>
6. Annual Reports of Procurement Contracts (2,200 contracts per year):
<http://www.nypa.gov/about/documents/2012AnnualReportofProcurementContracts.pdf>

³⁸ Available at: https://data.ny.gov/browse?Dataset-Information_Agency=Power+Authority

7. Annual Reports of Disposal of Personal Property: <http://www.nypa.gov/doingbusiness/PersonalProperty2013/2012AnnualReportofDisposal.pdf>
8. Power Allocation Recommendations: <http://www.nypa.gov/rechargeny/120424/Alphabetical%20List%20All%20April%202012%20Approved%20Allocations.pdf>
9. Data Tables in Build Smart NY Baseline Energy Report: <http://www.nypa.gov/BuildSmartNY/BaselineEnergyReport08-2013.pdf>
10. Proposals for Funds, e.g. St. Lawrence River Research & Education Fund: <http://www.nypa.gov/facilities/slrref/slrrefproposallist.htm>

Are agency budget, financials, project lists and capital projects available as open data?

No.

Public meetings: calendar, meeting resources, webcast

- Schedule or calendar of public events or meetings: No.
- Is the schedule/calendar downloadable: No.
- Are meeting minutes archived? How long? Downloadable? Yes. For 30 days.
- Are meeting briefing materials available? No.
- Machine readable? N/A.
- Archived? No.
- Are meetings webcast: Yes.³⁹
- Are webcasts archived: For 30 days.
- Are webcast transcripts available: No.

FOIL

- Are FOIL requests and/or responses public: No.
- Are FOIL requests publicly tracked: No.
- Is there an online FOIL form: No.

Are FAQs posted?

No.

³⁹ At the extremely user-friendly address of: <http://12.188.16.234:8080/nypa/>

Dormitory Authority

Summary

Oversees billions of dollars of capital projects: could open data on financial reports, statements, and bonds. Has virtually no open data on the portal. All information on contracts, procurements, etc. are provided in closed formats.

Does the agency have a large amount of discrete data online in document format?

Numerous budgets and procurement/contractor reports.

Is there an agency directory of downloadable or other data sets?

No.

Is there a "Transparency page?"

No.

Open data available via agency site?

No.

Open data available via data.ny.gov?

Yes. Four sets.

Are there links to Open NY / data.ny.gov on the agency site?

No.

Machine readable, downloadable files for tabular data within narrative documents?

No.

Are there links to Maps and GIS Layers?

No.

High value data not available to public in machine readable or downloadable form:.

1. Tables in Annual Financial Reports: <http://www.dasny.org/2013AnnualReport/>
2. Audited Financial Statements: <http://www.dasny.org/dasny/accountability/20122013/Basic%20Financial%20Statements%202013.pdf>
3. Bond Issue Ratings Report: http://www.dasny.org/dasny/Downloads/Ratings_Report.pdf
4. Official Revenue Bond Statements: http://www.dasny.org/dasny/OS_fiscal_1213/index.php
5. Operating Budgets: <http://www.dasny.org/dasny/Downloads/2014-15%20Proposed%20Operating%20Budget.pdf>
6. Procurement Reports: <http://www.dasny.org/dasny/accountability/20122013/Annual%20Procurement%20Report%2012-13.pdf>
7. New Construction Projects: <http://www.dasny.org/dasny/accountability/20122013/New%20Construction%20Projects.pdf>
8. Schedule of Debt Issuances: <http://www.dasny.org/dasny/accountability/20122013/Schedule%20of%20Debt%20Issuances.pdf>
9. Bid Results: <http://www.dasny.org/construc/bidres/index.php?category=all>
10. Job Order Contracts: <http://www.dasny.org/construc/jobOrder.php>
11. Procurement Opportunities: <http://www.dasny.org/construc/bidops/03C2.php>
12. Environmental Impact Statements: http://www.dasny.org/dasny/envaffs/impact_statements.php

Are agency budget, financials, project lists and capital projects available as open data?

No.

Public meetings: calendar, meeting resources, webcast

- Schedule or calendar of public events or meetings: No.
- Is the schedule/calendar downloadable: N/A.
- Are meeting minutes archived? How long? Downloadable? No.
- Are meeting briefing materials available? No.
- Machine readable? No.
- Archived? N/A.
- Are meetings webcast: Yes

- Are webcasts archived: Yes
- Are webcast transcripts available: No

FOIL

- Are FOIL requests and/or responses public: No.
- Are FOIL requests publicly tracked: No.
- Is there an online FOIL form: No.

Are FAQs posted?

No.

Thruway Authority

Summary

Web site contains a fairly small amount of data. Has already opened high-value data sets about capital projects (completed, current, and planned); financial statements and traffic data patterns are high-value but not open. Fails to open the tabular data contained in any reports, just as most agencies do.

Does the agency have a large amount of discrete data online in document format?

No. A handful of reports and financial statements.

Is there an agency directory of downloadable or other data sets?

No.

Is there a "Transparency page?"

No.

Open data available via agency site?

No.

Open data available via data.ny.gov?

Yes. Twenty sets, including high value like current capital projects and planned capital projects.

Are there links to Open NY / data.ny.gov on the agency site?

No.

Machine readable, downloadable files for tabular data within narrative documents?

No.

Are there links to Maps and GIS Layers?

Only via OpenNY

High value data not available to public in machine readable or downloadable form:.

1. Monthly Financial Reports: <http://www.thruway.ny.gov/about/financial/monthly/2013/monthly-financials/dec2013.pdf>
2. Monthly Traffic and Toll Revenue Report: <http://www.thruway.ny.gov/about/financial/monthly/2013/traffic/dec2013monthlytraffic.pdf>
3. Vehicle Trips, Miles and E-Z Pass Statistics: <http://www.thruway.ny.gov/about/financial/monthly/2013/vtm/dec2013vtm.pdf>
4. Budget Book: <http://www.thruway.ny.gov/about/financial/budgetbooks/books/2014-budget.pdf>
5. Audited Financial Statements: <http://www.thruway.ny.gov/about/financial/ar/2012-audited-financial-statements.pdf>
6. Thruway-wide Noise Barrier Prioritization Study Results: <http://www.thruway.ny.gov/about/environmental/noise.html>

Are agency budget, financials, project lists and capital projects available as open data?

No.

Public meetings: calendar, meeting resources, webcast

- Schedule or calendar of public events or meetings: Yes.
- Is the schedule/calendar downloadable: No.

- Are meeting minutes archived? How long? Downloadable? Yes. Back to 2005.
- Are meeting briefing materials available? No.
- Machine readable? No.
- Archived? No.
- Are meetings webcast: Yes
- Are webcasts archived: Yes
- Are webcast transcripts available: Yes.

FOIL

- Are FOIL requests and/or responses public: No.
- Are FOIL requests publicly tracked: No.
- Is there an online FOIL form: No.

Are FAQs posted?

No.

Department of Taxation and Finance

Summary

Statewide (and probably nationwide) best practice for narrative reports; tabular data is provided in XLS format for download alongside the PDF of the report. The Excel file contains a table of contents, a legend, and a separate page for each chart appearing in the report. Each page has both the chart/graph and the tabular information represented by that chart/graph. This is the single most complete view of data in any report published by any agency in this state.

Does the agency have a large amount of discrete data online in document format?

Yes.

Is there an agency directory of downloadable or other data sets?

No.

Is there a “Transparency page?”

No.

Open data available via agency site?

No.

Open data available via data.ny.gov?

Yes.⁴⁰

Are there links to Open NY / data.ny.gov on the agency site?

No.

Machine readable, downloadable files for tabular data within narrative documents?

Yes. Not for every report, but for dozens if not hundreds. For example:

1. Fiscal Year Tax Collections from 1994-2103: http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/collections/fy_collections_stat_report/2012_13_annual_statistical_report_of_ny_state_tax_collections.htm
2. Monthly Tax Collections Reports from 1996-2014: http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/collections/monthly_tax_collections.htm
3. Corporate Tax Statistical Reports from 1992-2009: http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/stats/stat_corp/corporate_tax_statistical_report.htm
4. Estate Tax Statistical Reports from 1994-2001: http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/stats/statistics/estate_tax_statistical_reports.htm
5. Personal Income Tax Statistical Publications: http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/stats/stat_pit/analysis_of_state_personal_income_tax_returns_by_place_of_residence.htm
6. Analysis of Personal Income Taxes: http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/stats/stat_pit/analysis_of_personal_income_tax_returns.htm
7. Child and Dependent Care Credit Statistics: http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/stats/stat_pit/child_and_dependentcare_credit.htm

⁴⁰ Available at: https://data.ny.gov/browse?Dataset-Information_Agency=Taxation+and+Finance%2C+Department+of

8. Earned Income Tax Credit Analysis: http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/stats/stat_pit/earned_income_tax_credit_analysis_of_credit_claims.htm
9. Real Property Circuit Breaker Tax Credit Analysis: http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/stats/stat_pit/real_property_circuit_breaker_tax_credit.htm

Are there links to Maps and GIS Layers?

No.

High value data not available to public in machine readable or downloadable form:

Restricted Search:

1. County Real Property Directors: http://orpts.tax.ny.gov/cfapps/MuniPro/muni_theme/state/diraddr.cfm
2. Summaries of Exemptions and Values: http://orpts.tax.ny.gov/cfapps/MuniPro/muni_theme/state/exindex.cfm?swis=59&prefix=Statewide
3. Statewide Equalization Rates: http://orpts.tax.ny.gov/cfapps/MuniPro/muni_theme/county/equasearch.cfm?swis=59
4. Summary of Tax Rate and Levy Data: <http://orpts.tax.ny.gov/cfapps/MuniPro/osc/oscYearselect.cfm>
5. RAR Information: <http://orpts.tax.ny.gov/cfapps/MuniPro/rar/srarsearch.cfm?swis=59>
6. Assessment Equity Statistics: http://orpts.tax.ny.gov/cfapps/MuniPro/cod/survey_year.cfm?swis=00
7. MuniPro: http://orpts.tax.ny.gov/cfapps/MuniPro/muni_theme/county/county.cfm?swis=03

PDF/HTML Tables:

1. Summary of Tax Expenditures: <http://publications.budget.ny.gov/eBudget1415/fy1415ter/TaxExpenditure2014-15.pdf>
2. Distribution of Parcel by Property Class Code: <http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/property/reports/parcels/2012/index.htm>
3. Exemptions from Real Property Taxation: <http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/property/reports/exempt/12index.htm>
4. Overall Full-Value Tax Rates by County: http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/property/reports/fvtaxrates/overall_county_12.htm

5. Small Claims Assessment Review Activity 2003-2012: http://www.tax.ny.gov/pubs_and_bulls/orpts/publications/reports_annual.htm
6. Tax Certiorari Activity 2003-2012: http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/property/reports/scarcertiorari/certiorario3_12.htm
7. Property Tax Publications Archive: http://www.tax.ny.gov/pubs_and_bulls/orpts/publications/property_pubs_prior.htm
8. Residential Median Sale Price Information: <http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/property/assess/sales/resmedian.htm>

Are agency budget, financials, project lists and capital projects available as open data?

No.

Public meetings: calendar, meeting resources, webcast

- Schedule or calendar of public events or meetings: No.
- Is the schedule/calendar downloadable: No.
- Are meeting minutes archived? How long? Downloadable? No.
- Are meeting briefing materials available? No.
- Machine readable? N/A
- Archived? N/A
- Are meetings webcast: Some.⁴¹
- Are webcasts archived: Yes
- Are webcast transcripts available: No.

FOIL

- Are FOIL requests and/or responses public: No.
- Are FOIL requests publicly tracked: No.
- Is there an online FOIL form: No.

Are FAQs posted?

Yes. On a number of topics:

- Local Government Data Download: http://www.tax.ny.gov/pit/property/assess/reform/local_gov_data.htm

⁴¹ Example: <http://www.tax.ny.gov/research/property/legal/stbd/index.htm>

- Online Assessment Data/GIS & Mapping Resources: <http://www.tax.ny.gov/pit/property/assess/local/index.htm>
- Municipal Profiles (Munipro): <http://orpts.tax.ny.gov/MuniPro/>

Department of Financial Services

Summary

Innumerable reports and statements about the fiscal health and responsibility of insurance and banking entities in New York State. Thousands of balance sheets and transaction histories. After the financial meltdown of 2008, these industries have drawn intense public interest, and data about them should be opened to the public instead of locked away in PDFs.

Does the agency have a large amount of discrete data online in document format?

Yes. Hundreds of reports with thousands of charts and tables.

Is there an agency directory of downloadable or other data sets?

No.

Is there a "Transparency page?"

No.

Open data available via agency site?

No.

Open data available via data.ny.gov?

Yes. Six data sets.⁴²

Are there links to Open NY / data.ny.gov on the agency site?

No.

⁴² Available at: https://data.ny.gov/browse?Dataset-Information_Agency=Financial+Services%2C+Department+of

Machine readable, downloadable files for tabular data within narrative documents?

No.

Are there links to Maps and GIS Layers?

None.

High value data not available to public in machine readable or downloadable form:.

1. Hundreds of Examination Reports on Health, Life, and Property Insurance Companies: http://www.dfs.ny.gov/insurance/ex_index.htm#exindex
2. Community Reinvestment Act Ratings and Performance Evaluations: http://www.dfs.ny.gov/reportpub/cra_reports/crarate.htm
3. Insurance Fraud Bureau Statistics: http://www.dfs.ny.gov/reportpub/fraud/ffcpd_annualrep_2012.pdf
4. Banking Statistics and Insurance Statistics: http://www.dfs.ny.gov/reportpub/annual/dfs_annualrpt_2012.pdf
5. Demographics of Insurance Agents: http://www.dfs.ny.gov/reportpub/insurance/annualrpt_2012_agent_lic_exams_statistics.pdf
6. Statistics on Long-Term Care Insurance Policies: <http://www.dfs.ny.gov/reportpub/insurance/ltrcpt2013.pdf>
7. Enforcement Actions: <http://www.dfs.ny.gov/about/eagen.htm>
8. Auto Insurance Complaints: <http://www.dfs.ny.gov/consumer/auto/aut02012.pdf>
9. Health Insurance Complaints: http://www.dfs.ny.gov/consumer/health/cg_health_2013.pdf

Are agency budget, financials, project lists and capital projects available as open data?

No.

Public meetings: calendar, meeting resources, webcast

- Schedule or calendar of public events or meetings: Yes.⁴³
- Is the schedule/calendar downloadable: No.
- Are meeting minutes archived? How long? Downloadable? Yes: since 2006.
- Are meeting briefing materials available? Yes.

⁴³ Here: http://www.dfs.ny.gov/about/public_hearing.htm

- Machine readable? No.
- Archived? Yes.
- Are meetings webcast: No.
- Are webcasts archived: No.
- Are webcast transcripts available: Yes.

FOIL

- Are FOIL requests and/or responses public: No.
- Are FOIL requests publicly tracked: No.
- Is there an online FOIL form: No.

Are FAQs posted?

No.

Division of Criminal Justice

Summary

Publishes reports with statistics about crimes, punishments, and everything in between. Reports are all PDFs, but a small fraction of reports are accompanied by XLS files of the vital statistics contained within. Doesn't contain a particularly enormous amount of data, but has everything here is extremely valuable to social activists: data on domestic violence, hate crimes, missing children, etc.

Does the agency have a large amount of discrete data online in document format?

Yes. Hundreds of charts and tables.

Is there an agency directory of downloadable or other data sets?

No.

Is there a "Transparency page?"

No. "Statistics" is the close: <http://www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/crimnet/ojsa/stat-s.htm>

Open data available via agency site?

Yes. Examples of data in open formats:

1. Hate Crime Incidents: <http://www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/crimnet/ojsa/hatecrimeincidents2012.xls>
2. Domestic Violence Victim Data: <http://www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/crimnet/ojsa/domesticviolence/index.htm>
3. Juvenile Arrests by County: <http://www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/crimnet/ojsa/juvenilearrests/index.htm>
4. Dispositions of Arrests: <http://www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/crimnet/ojsa/dispos/index.htm>
5. Juvenile Justice Statistics, including detention, sentences, placement, probation, and adjustments: <http://www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/crimnet/ojsa/stats.htm>
6. County Trends in Reporting Missing Persons: <http://www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/crimnet/ojsa/mcannuals/1990-2012-missing-children-county-trends.xls>

Open data available via data.ny.gov?

Yes. Eight data sets.⁴⁴

Are there links to Open NY / data.ny.gov on the agency site?

Yes. From “Statistics” page, noting that more data is available on data.ny.gov.

Machine readable, downloadable files for tabular data within narrative documents?

No.

Are there links to Maps and GIS Layers?

None.

⁴⁴ Available at: https://data.ny.gov/browse?Dataset-Information_Agency=Criminal+Justice+Services%2C+Division+of

High value data not available to public in machine readable or downloadable form:.

PDF/HTML Tables:

1. Parolee and Probationer Arrests: <http://www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/crimnet/ojsa/parolee-and-probationer-arrest.pdf>
2. Probationer Felony Re-Arrest Rates: <http://www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/crimnet/ojsa/probationer-rearrests.pdf>
3. Monthly DNA Collection Rates by County: http://www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/crimnet/ojsa/dna_collections.pdf
4. County Reentry Task Force Program Activity Reports: <http://www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/crimnet/ojsa/Jul-to-Jun-2013-CRTF-Report.pdf>
5. Juvenile Justice Indicators Quarterly Update Summary: http://www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/crimnet/ojsa/juvenile_justice_indicators.pdf
6. Dozens of reports: <http://www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/crimnet/pubs.htm>⁴⁵
7. Felony Drug Arrest, Indictment and Commitment Trends: http://www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/pio/annualreport/baseline_trends_report.pdf

Are agency budget, financials, project lists and capital projects available as open data?
No.

Public meetings: calendar, meeting resources, webcast

- Schedule or calendar of public events or meetings: Yes.⁴⁶
- Is the schedule/calendar downloadable: No.
- Are meeting minutes archived? How long? Downloadable? Since 2006.
- Are meeting briefing materials available? Yes.
- Machine readable? No.
- Archived? Yes.
- Are meetings webcast: No.
- Are webcasts archived: No.
- Are webcast transcripts available: No.

⁴⁵ See: Statistics on Domestic Homicide: <http://www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/crimnet/ojsa/domestic-homicide-2012.pdf>

⁴⁶ At: http://www.dfs.ny.gov/about/public_hearing.htm

FOIL

- Are FOIL requests and/or responses public: No.
- Are FOIL requests publicly tracked: No.
- Is there an online FOIL form: No.

Are FAQs posted?

No.

Department of Motor Vehicles

Summary

The customer side of the DMV is very clear and helpful. The DMV also collects statistics, some of which can be found in machine-readable format on the NY Open Data page. However, up-to-date Crash Statistics are still locked up in PDFs.

Does the agency have a large amount of discrete data online in document format?

Yes. Crash Statistics, Driver Licenses on File, and Vehicle Registrations in Force.⁴⁷

Is there an agency directory of downloadable or other data sets?

No

Is there a "Transparency page?"

No

Open data available via agency site?

No

Open data available via data.ny.gov?

Yes, at least twenty sets. This includes Driver License, Permit and other document information by age and sex; DMV Facilities; Vehicle, Snowmobile and Boat Registrations; Vehicle Repair Shops, etc.

⁴⁷ See: <http://dmv.ny.gov/about-dmv/statistical-summaries>

NYS crash statistics are also available on the Open NY site. But most of these datasets have not been updated since 2011 or 2012.

Is there a link to data.ny.gov?

No

Machine readable, downloadable files for tabular data within narrative documents?

No

High value data not available to public in machine readable or downloadable form:.

No.

Are agency budget, financials, project lists and capital projects available as open data?

No

Public meetings: calendar, meeting resources, webcast

None of the above.

FOIL

- Are FOIL requests and/or responses public: No
- Are FOIL requests publicly tracked: No
- Is there an online FOIL form: No

Are FAQs posted?

In a way, yes as the homepage has specific links dependent upon specific requests.

We request that the DMV publish the following data in a internet searchable, downloadable, machine readable format:

Up to date Crash Statistics

Department of Parks, Recreation, and Historic Preservation

Summary

While this department may collect more data from other agencies than it generates from its own activities, it has an opportunity to provide this raw interagency data to the public in open formats. Calendars that users can subscribe to with their smartphones, RSS feeds for residents' local park(s) which

Does the agency have a large amount of discrete data online in document format?

Yes, but most of the Parks data is gathered from other departments such as Environmental Conservation. They do have:

- Maps for different parks: <http://nysparks.com/parks/default.aspx?tab=1>
- List of state parks with campgrounds: <http://nysparks.com/parks/park-results.aspx?a=754&ao=0&src=3&cap=1>
- Historic sites: <http://nysparks.com/historic-sites/>
- Map of heritage areas: <http://nysparks.com/historic-preservation/heritage-areas.aspx>

Is there an agency directory of downloadable or other data sets?

No.

Is there a "Transparency page?"

No.

Open data available via agency site?

No.

Open data available via data.ny.gov?

Yes. There are 16 data sets.

Is there a link to data.ny.gov?

No

Machine readable, downloadable files for tabular data within narrative documents?

No.

Are there links to Maps and GIS Layers?

There are many maps, but not in any downloadable format besides a PDF.

High value data not available to public in machine readable or downloadable form:.

Mostly provided by other agencies, such as the link to bird conservation areas:
<http://nysparks.com/environment/bird-conservation-areas.aspx>

Are agency budget, financials, project lists and capital projects available as open data?

No

Public meetings: calendar, meeting resources, webcast

None of the above.

FOIL

- Are FOIL requests and/or responses public: No.
- Are FOIL requests publicly tracked: No.
- Is there an online FOIL form: No.

FAQ

No, but there are extensive drop-down menus for different Park and Recreation options throughout the website

Department of Transportation

Summary

Wildly inconsistent practices for cataloging and displaying data online. It is confusing to navigate the website itself (despite its clean-looking design) and to find

usable datasets. There is significant data in different formats; some in PDFs, some in CSVs, and even more embedded in the website in HTML tables.

It also must be noted that most of this data was found by searching for “data” on the search box, and not through an easily understandable web page interface. Thus, this is by no means a comprehensive audit.

Does the agency have a large amount of discrete data online in document format?

There is data in the “Projects” section, but not in discrete document format. Projects can be searched by Location, MPO, or Legislative area. Users can search construction projects by a map, but there is no way to download the map.⁴⁸

Each project has its own webpage, for example: the BRIDGE CORRECTIVE REPAIR (ARRA) VARIOUS COUNTIES project has tabular data embedded in the webpage itself: projects costs and employee numbers, hours worked, payroll, etc.⁴⁹

Is there an agency directory of downloadable or other data sets?

There is no centralized directory, though there are some downloadable data sets.

Is there a “Transparency page?”

No

Open data available via agency site?

- Downloadable Traffic Volume Data for NYS: <https://www.dot.ny.gov/divisions/engineering/technical-services/highway-data-services/hdsb>
- Highway Mileage Report: <https://www.dot.ny.gov/divisions/engineering/technical-services/highway-data-services>

Open data available via data.ny.gov?

Yes, there are 28 data sets, but these sets do not cover the PDF data included in the NYSDOT’s Transportation Trends, Survey & Statistics page.

⁴⁸ Available at <https://www.dot.ny.gov/projects>

⁴⁹ See: https://www.dot.ny.gov/portal/pls/portal/MEXIS_APP.DYN_ARRA_DETAILS.show?p_arg_names=p_pin&p_arg_values=X80646

Is there a link to data.ny.gov?

No.

Machine readable, downloadable files for tabular data within narrative documents?

Yes, see above

Are there links to Maps and GIS Layers? data sets?

There are many maps in PDF form. For example, the Traffic Data Viewer: Real time traffic map, not downloadable. There is a contact phone number and email to make a request for downloading GIS information.⁵⁰

High value data not available to public in machine readable or downloadable form:.

Data in PDF:

1. Transportation Trends, Survey & Statistics: <https://www.dot.ny.gov/divisions/policy-and-strategy/darb/dai-unit/ttss> Contains links to census information hosted on web pages outside of SDOT.
2. Transportation Statistics at a Glance Interim Update for 2010: https://www.dot.ny.gov/divisions/policy-and-strategy/darb/dai-unit/ttss/repository/Table1_TranspStatsGlance_Update.pdf
3. Trans-Border Data: <https://www.dot.ny.gov/divisions/policy-and-strategy/darb/dai-unit/ttss/trans-border-data>
4. Change in Traffic on NYS Bridges, Thruway and Roads: <https://www.dot.ny.gov/divisions/policy-and-strategy/darb/dai-unit/ttss/trans-border-data>
5. Pavement Condition Reports are in PDF, contains numerous graphs and tables: <https://www.dot.ny.gov/divisions/engineering/technical-services/pavement-management>
6. The Engineering Division has numerous PDFs: <https://www.dot.ny.gov/divisions/engineering/technical-services>
7. Traffic Data Report - substantial tabular data locked up in PDFs <https://www.dot.ny.gov/divisions/engineering/technical-services/highway-data-services/traffic-data>

⁵⁰ At <https://www.dot.ny.gov/tdv>

Are agency budget, financials, project lists and capital projects available as open data?

No, most of that is locked up in HTML tables.

Public meetings: calendar, meeting resources, webcast

Their calendar is in a nice, easy to use format and they seem to be fairly consistent in webcasting and having relevant documents such as agendas to accompany the webcasts. However, you must download a program to view the video.⁵¹

- Schedule or calendar of public events or meetings: Yes
- Is the schedule/calendar downloadable: No
- Are meeting minutes archived? How long? Downloadable? Yes.
- Are meeting briefing materials available? Yes.
- Machine readable? No.
- Are meetings webcast: Yes
- Are webcasts archived: Yes
- Are webcast transcripts available: No

FOIL

- Are FOIL requests and/or responses public: No.
- Are FOIL requests publicly tracked: No.
- Is there an online FOIL form: No.

Are FAQs posted?

Yes.⁵² On the top right of each page there is a “How do I?” dropdown menu.

⁵¹ See: <https://www.dot.ny.gov/main/webcast>

⁵² At <https://www.dot.ny.gov/about-nysdot/faq>