

EMPIRE STATION COMMUNITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE WORKING GROUP

DATE/TIME: May 11, 2021 / 4:00pm EST
WEEK #: 3

SUBJECT: Gateway
MEETING LEADER: Amtrak

The following minutes prepared by Empire State Development are a summary of the meeting and are intended to capture only the main points made in the meeting. Discrepancies should be reported to Gabriella Green at Empire State Development **within three (3) calendar days** of distribution of this document.

PARTICIPANTS:

NAME	ORGANIZATION / AGENCY	NAME	ORGANIZATION / AGENCY
Hon. Gale Brewer	Manhattan Borough President	Layla Law-Gisiko	Community Board 5
Hon. Brad Hoylman	New York State Senate	EJ Kalafarski	Community Board 5
Robert Atterbury	U.S. Congressman Jerrold Nadler	Alfred Cerullo	Grand Central Partnership
Robert Gottheim	U.S. Congressman Jerrold Nadler	Eugene Sinigalliano	Resident Representative
Shelby Garner	U.S. Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney	Julia Campanelli	Hell's Kitchen Block Association
Betsy Schmid	U.S. Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney	Basha Gerhards	Real Estate Board of New York
Dario Quinsac	NYS Senator Robert Jackson	Jessica Walker	Manhattan Chamber of Commerce
Maia Berlow	NYS Senator Brad Hoylman	Tom Wright	Regional Plan Association
Jacob Priley	NYS Senator Brad Hoylman	Wendy Hilliard	Women's Sports Foundation
Wendi Paster	NYS Assemblyman Richard Gottfried	Felicia Park-Rogers	Tri-State Transportation Campaign
Matt Tighe	NYS Assemblyman Richard Gottfried	Tokumbo	New School
Lizette Chaparro	Manhattan Borough President's Office	Shobowale	University of Pennsylvania
Matthew Washington	Manhattan Borough President's Office	Marilyn Taylor	University of Pennsylvania
Matt Green	NYC Councilman Corey Johnson	Larry Lennon	MTA
Laurie Hardjowirogo	NYC Councilman Corey Johnson	Peter Matusewitch	MTA
Louis Bailey	WE ACT for Environmental Justice	Robert Paley	MTA
Dan Biederman	34th Street Partnership	William Schwartz	MTA
Kevin Finnegan	Labor lawyer, formerly 1199	Petra Messick	Amtrak
Denis Johnston	32BJ	Ryan Morson	Amtrak
Marrissa Williams	32BJ	Craig Schulz	Amtrak
Gary LaBarbera	Building & Construction Trades Council of NY	Sharon Tepper	Amtrak
Santos Rodriguez	Building & Construction Trades Council of NY	Josh Kraus	NYCEDC
Brook Jackson	Partnership for New York City	Jennifer Sta. Ines	NYC DOT
Elizabeth Goldstein	The Municipal Art Society of NY	Edith Hsu-Chen	NYC Dept of Planning
Christine Berthet	Community Board 4	Jeremy Colangelo-Bryan	NJ Transit
Lowell Kern	Community Board 4	Todd DiScala	NJ Transit
Paul Devlin	Community Board 4	Joseph Quinty	NJ Transit
Jeffrey LeFrancois	Community Board 4	Judy Kessler	Vornado
Vikki Barbero	Community Board 5	Audrey Wilson	Vornado

NAME	ORGANIZATION / AGENCY	NAME	ORGANIZATION / AGENCY
Monique Dorroh	FX Collaborative		
Deniz Onder	FX Collaborative		
Toby Snyder	FX Collaborative		
Amy Shell	FX Collaborative		
Holly Leicht	ESD		
Gabriella Green	ESD		
Marion Phillips	ESD		
Angel Santana	ESD		
Anabel Frias	ESD		
Noura von Briesen	ESD		
Francisco Polanco	ESD		
Rachel Shatz	ESD		
Terence Cho	ESD		
Phil Maguire	ESD		

Location: Zoom

Item # Description / Discussion

1. INTRODUCTORY REMARKS AND HOUSEKEEPING

- Introduction by Marion Phillips, Senior VP of Community Relations at ESD, who reminded all attendees to list their full name and affiliation in the Zoom Participant List.
- Marion also reminded those CACWG members dialing in by phone to alert Angel Santana in order to be admitted to the meeting. In addition, CACWG members who are inviting staff members from their organizations for the first time should also alert Angel Santana.
- Gabriella Green, CACWG Facilitator, updated CACWG members that ESD is compiling all requests and questions that require additional follow-up and will notify all CACWG members when follow-up materials are posted to Huddle.
- Gabriella also provided an update on the question regarding what impacts the new Port Authority Bus Terminal (“PABT”) and Penn Expansion would have on one another. Gabriella cited The Port Authority’s “Trans-Hudson Commuting Capacity Study”, in which the following points are made:
 - The report agreed with statements made by RPA and NJ Transit (“NJT”) during CACWG Meeting #2 that the trans-Hudson commuting market is served by a number of distinct transportation systems without a great deal of overlap across ridership use. ESD also reached out to The Port Authority who confirmed the same understanding.
 - The report states that improvements to an individual transportation system do not greatly increase or decrease the use of other transportation systems.
 - The report also states that with all the trans-Hudson improvements in place (e.g., Gateway, ferry service enhancements, PATH service expansion), demand at PABT may go down 10-20%, which would not be a sufficient reduction to justify any change to the plans to replace PABT.
 - Due to the absence of overlap across transportation systems and the projected future large increases in trans-Hudson ridership, the report concludes that all of the trans-Hudson transportation improvement projects are needed.
 - The report is available on The Port Authority’s [website](#) and on Huddle.
- Holly Leicht, Executive VP of Real Estate at ESD, provided updates on other CACWG follow-up materials:
 - ESD will share information on why the CACWG meetings are not subject to the Open Meetings Law.
 - ESD is also collecting and will share the data requested by Christine Berthet on each of the railroad projects and the respective incremental changes in ridership for each project.

2. AMTRAK PRESENTATION: THE NORTHEAST CORRIDOR

- Petra Messick, Director of Planning, Gateway Program at Amtrak, presented on the components and progress of the Gateway Program (“Gateway”).

Item #	Description / Discussion
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Amtrak’s role in Gateway stems from its ownership of the majority of the Northeast Corridor (“NEC”), which extends from Washington, D.C. to Boston and is 100 years old. • In making improvements to the NEC, Amtrak is planning for how the NEC will serve the U.S. northeast regional economy for the next 100 years. The Gateway Program focuses on promoting sustainable and equitable growth of rail transit access to Manhattan’s job and economic center. • The NEC is a blend of intercity, commuter and freight operations. Amtrak is a minority user; commuter railroads dominate the traffic on the NEC, making the NEC very important to the northeast regional economy because the corridor transports people to job centers such as New York City. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ 7 million jobs are located within 5 miles of an NEC station ➤ \$50 billion annual contribution to the U.S. economy by workers riding the NEC ➤ \$100 million cost to the U.S. of a single day loss of NEC service
3.	<p data-bbox="215 583 992 611"><u>AMTRAK PRESENTATION: CLIMATE AND SUSTAINABILITY GOALS</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Amtrak is reviewing how rail can reduce climate emissions. Amtrak believes that shifting travelers away from higher-polluting auto and air trips is critical to achieving sustainability goals. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Reducing greenhouse gas emissions: Amtrak service is 47% more energy efficient than travel by car, and about 36% more efficient than domestic air travel. ➤ Reducing other forms of air pollution: 20% reduced emissions from 2010 levels and 40% reduction by 2030 ➤ Opportunities for further progress: Goal is carbon-free Northeast Corridor; future electrification and more energy-efficient train equipment among sustainability initiatives • Capacity expansion on the NEC is crucial to achieving these environmental goals.
4.	<p data-bbox="215 989 773 1016"><u>AMTRAK PRESENTATION: AMTRAK NETWORK</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Amtrak is looking to expand and modernize its network across the U.S. • Outside the northeast, Amtrak predominately runs its rail operations on tracks that it does not own, requiring partnerships with states to expand service in existing markets and bring service to new markets. • Amtrak is also looking to bring new service to the New York City market including parts of Pennsylvania and Long Island. These service expansions are contingent on expanding capacity at Penn Station. • Amtrak is planning for capital improvement or replacement projects for many aging assets, some of which date to the late nineteenth century, across the entire NEC.
5.	<p data-bbox="215 1360 919 1388"><u>AMTRAK PRESENTATION: NEW YORK, THE HEART OF NEC</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the New York Region, Amtrak owns: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Penn Station ➤ North River Tunnel (“NRT”) (tunnel underneath Hudson River containing two single track tubes to Penn Station) ➤ East River Tunnel (“ERT”) (tunnel underneath East River containing four single track tubes connecting Penn Station to Sunnyside Yards) ➤ Hellgate Line ➤ The NEC through New Jersey • Rail traffic on the two tracks between Newark, NJ and Penn Station is the most constrained portion of the NEC and has the highest density of rail traffic on the NEC. • In addition, the highest number of train movements overall on the NEC occurs at Harold Interlocking where the Long Island Railroad (“LIRR”) meets the NEC.
6.	<p data-bbox="215 1860 940 1887"><u>AMTRAK PRESENTATION: GATEWAY PROGRAM OVERVIEW</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Gateway Program is a series of projects with the goal of providing more resiliency, operational flexibility and increased rail capacity by:

Item #	Description / Discussion
--------	--------------------------

- Repairing and rehabilitating rail assets in the New Jersey-New York portion of the NEC that are over 100 years old, have extensive damage from Hurricane Sandy, have outdated design, and take a large amount of traffic from three NJT lines.
- Doubling capacity to meet future demand for New Jersey-New York commutation, the fastest growing commuter market in the region.

7. AMTRAK PRESENTATION: PORTAL NORTH BRIDGE PROJECT

- Project to replace 2.4 miles of tracks, upgrade and modernize all systems, and replace existing Portal Bridge, which is currently a swing bridge that opens to barge traffic, with a high-level fixed bridge, called Portal North Bridge. This project will eliminate delays resulting from opening the current swing Portal Bridge.
 - First-of-its-kind joint intercity rail and commuter rail project to get a grant from Federal Transit Administration’s (FTA) Capital Investment Grant program
 - \$766.5 million Full Funding Grant Agreement signed in January 2021 between FTA & NJT
 - \$1.8 billion project cost; Amtrak is contributing \$350 million of project cost
 - NJT-led procurement underway for major construction
 - Anticipated construction start: winter 2021/2022

8. AMTRAK PRESENTATION: HUDSON TUNNEL PROJECT

- The signature project of Gateway and sponsored by Amtrak, The Port Authority, NJT and Gateway Program Development Corporation (“GPDC”), the Hudson Tunnel Project will provide two new single-track tubes to Penn Station under the Hudson River south of the existing NRT.
- The Hudson Tunnel Project will allow Amtrak to shift all existing Amtrak and NJT traffic from NRT into the new Hudson River Tunnel (“HRT”) so that the existing NRT can be repaired including:
 - Replacement of ballasted tracks
 - Repair of benchwalls
 - Replacement of systems
- With the completion of HRT and repairs at NRT, four tunnel tracks will connect New Jersey to Penn Station.
- U.S. Department of Transportation (USDOT) has announced that it plans to issue the Record of Decision (“ROD”) and Final Environmental Impact Statement (“FEIS”) for the Hudson Tunnel Project on May 28. The issuance of the ROD and approval of the FEIS mark the conclusion of the environmental review in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) and will clear the project sponsors to proceed with acquiring property, updating its financial plan and procuring contractors.
- The cost of the Hudson Tunnel Project projected in the FEIS is approximately \$11.6 billion, but this will have to be updated after the ROD is issued.
- The Hudson Tunnel Project financial plan seeks an FTA grant of approximately \$5.5 billion and includes commitments of \$1.3 billion from Amtrak and \$2.7 billion from PANYNJ + NY/NJ via the federal Railroad Rehabilitation & Improvement Financing program (“RRIF”). The financial plan will be updated for a fall submission to the President’s budget.
- Construction of the Hudson Yards Concrete Casing between Tenth and Eleventh Avenues underneath Hudson Yards started in 2013 and is now complete.
- Currently, work is underway underneath Eleventh and Twelfth Avenues to relocate utilities and the LIRR Emergency Services Building for the third and final phase of the concrete casing.
- Gateway Development Commission (“GDC”), a New Jersey-New York bi-state agency, was set up to facilitate the Hudson Tunnel Project (see <http://www.gatewayprogram.org/the-gateway-development-commission.html>).

10. AMTRAK PRESENTATION: PENN STATION EXPANSION PROJECT

Item #	Description / Discussion
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A key piece of Gateway and sponsored by Amtrak, NJT and MTA (the “Railroads”), the Penn Station Expansion Project’s purpose (“Penn Expansion”) is to expand the tracks at Penn Station to meet the new HRT so that rail service capacity can be increased to meet future demand. • Penn Expansion, the Hudson Tunnel Project, and the Gateway projects in New Jersey are all necessary to increase rail capacity into Manhattan. • Amtrak expects to begin design of the Penn Expansion in August 2021 and is currently is procuring an architecture/engineering contract. • MTA will act as lead local agency for the Penn Expansion for the federal NEPA review, which will begin following the issuance of the Hudson Tunnel Project ROD. The first phase of the Penn Expansion NEPA review process will involve the issuance of a Notice of Intent (NOI) and an analysis of alternative (“Alternatives Analysis”) plans and locations for the expansion of Penn Station. This first phase will have opportunities for public comment and engagement. • ESD’s General Project Plan (“GPP”) considers properties under which new tracks may be built if the plan to expand Penn Station to these properties is advanced by the Railroads in the NOI and ultimately selected as the preferred alternative in the federal review process, after being fully evaluated in a completed NEPA environmental review.
11. <u>AMTRAK PRESENTATION: PENN STATION MASTER PLANNING</u>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reconstruction of the existing Penn Station (“Penn Reconstruction) is important to Gateway to integrate existing Penn Station with Penn Expansion, Moynihan Train Hall and the surrounding neighborhood, with an emphasis on: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ Improving circulation & passenger flow ➢ Unifying the Empire Station Complex by integrating the transportation services that access it ➢ Accommodating future railroad growth and new operations including Metro-North Penn Access ➢ Increasing light, air, and passenger amenities ➢ Evaluating the cost of different options and seeking the best return on investment
12. <u>AMTRAK PRESENTATION: OTHER GATEWAY PROJECTS</u>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sawtooth Bridges Replacement Project (Project Phase: Design) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ Project to replace deteriorating two-track structures with structures carrying four Northeast Corridor tracks, delivering new capacity ➢ Amtrak expects to achieve 30% construction drawings in approximately 18 months. • Harrison Fourth Track (Project Phase: Design) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ Project to relocate PATH track and signaling equipment further north to accommodate a fourth NEC track; creates interim pocket track with operational benefits ➢ Amtrak will advance this project in the next few years. • Dock Bridge Rehabilitation Project (Project Phase: Design) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ Project to convert moveable bridge to fixed bridge, repair steel, concrete piers, replace fenders, and repaint bridge; reduces delays on PATH, NJT and Amtrak associated with bridge openings; restores state of good repair ➢ Amtrak estimates project cost to be \$64 million and hopes to begin this project in FY 2022. • Portal South Bridge (Project Phase: Planning) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ Project to construct a second, two-track bridge over the Hackensack River to support service growth • Secaucus Junction Station Improvements (Project Phase: Planning) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ Project to expand and reconfigure tracks at Secaucus Junction to support service growth • Secaucus/Bergen Loop (Project Phase: Planning) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ Project to construct loop tracks to provide direct service (“a one-seat ride”) for NJT and Metro-North customers on the Main & Bergen, Port Jervis, and Pascack Valley lines to Penn Station • Gateway Storage Yard (Project Phase: Planning)

- Project to construct new NJT storage yard required for Gateway Program service growth
- Location options under evaluation

13. Q&A AND COMMENTS

- Paul Devlin, CB4
 - Are there plans to connect the four HRT and NRT tracks to the four ERT tracks?
 - The two new HRT will terminate at the Penn Expansion. Of the four ERT tubes, which are referred to as “Lines”, Lines 3 and 4 at the northeast of Penn Station primarily serve LIRR. Lines 1 and 2 are primarily used by Amtrak and NJT trains to access Sunnyside Yard and by Amtrak trains to continue from Penn Station along the NEC to Boston.
 - The majority of the new train traffic that will be using the new HRT will be NJT traffic going to Penn Expansion, which will be designed as a “stub-end” station. Once at Penn Expansion, the NJT trains will discharge passengers and either leave the station or wait to board new passengers for the reverse trip.
 - Due to physical limitations, it is not possible for trains going into Penn Expansion to access ERT. However, Penn Expansion will be designed so that tracks can descend under the Sixth Avenue subway lines and extend eastward in the future, possibly to a future 5th and 6th East River Tunnel. This is not part of Gateway.
 - Does Amtrak own Moynihan Train Hall?
 - Moynihan Train Hall is owned by the State of New York, while the tracks underneath Moynihan Train Hall are owned by Amtrak and are the same ones that serve existing Penn.
 - Do the tracks dead end at Seventh Avenue?
 - The existing tracks 1-4 end at Seventh Avenue and are precluded from extending further east by the Sixth and Seventh Avenue subways. Any future tracks built at Penn Expansion would be built so as not to preclude the possibility of extending those tracks to the east as part of a future project.
- Christine Berthet, CB4
 - How many tracks and platforms at Penn Station will be freed up by East Side Access?
 - East Side Access will shift some LIRR trains from Penn Station to Grand Central, but those tracks will be used by Metro-North to serve the new stations in the Bronx. Thus, the MTA will continue to use the same Penn Station tracks it currently uses.
 - Are all of the new slots being made available for LIRR and Metro-North truly needed?
 - The projections for growth in LIRR and Metro-North support the need for increased LIRR and Metro-North service capacity.
 - How many tracks will be built at Penn Expansion?
 - A least eight tracks will be built at Penn Expansion, but ideally more – there needs to be additional engineering and design work to determine exact number.
 - Can Penn Expansion be built by boring under the existing buildings?
 - Engineering analysis to date suggests that the Penn Expansion cannot be built by boring under the existing buildings due to the relatively shallow depth that is necessary for the tracks to match up with the existing Penn tracks; however, the Railroads will continue to refine their engineering assumptions during the Planning phase, and this will be further analyzed in the NEPA process.
 - Will the tunnel projects require the construction of ventilation plants?
 - Two ventilation plants are planned as part of the Hudson Tunnel Project: one in Hoboken, NJ; and another in Block 675, Lot 1 located at Twelfth Avenue between 30th and 31st streets. Further information about the HRT ventilation plants can be found in the DEIS (<http://www.hudsonstunnelproject.com/deis.html>).
- Marilyn Taylor, UPenn
 - How will construction of the Hudson Tunnel Project be phased to minimize service disruption?

- The construction of both HRT tubes will take place simultaneously and should not have any impact on current railroad operations until the final connection of the HRT tubes to Penn Station. The Railroads hope to limit disruption of service so that it is not more than when work was done in recent summers to renew Penn Station tracks.
 - Will NJT add trains when construction on HRT starts?
 - NJT runs 21 trains currently in the peak hour, which is the maximum number of trains that can be run. To increase capacity, NJT has made trains longer and added double-level trains, but no additional trains are being contemplated in association with the Hudson Tunnel Project.
- Dario Quinsac, State Senator Jackson
 - Have the Railroads analyzed Block 807 (east of existing Penn) as a location for Penn Expansion?
 - The Railroads have analyzed Block 807 in the past for Penn Expansion. It is impossible to expand eastward from the existing tracks because the subways are in the way, so expanding east of existing Penn Station would require excavating new tunnels and tracks deep underneath Penn. Amtrak would have serious concerns about a project causing vibrations that could damage Penn Station or disrupt existing rail operations. Expanding into Block 807 would also require a split-off from the HRT at a location very far west to allow for an acceptable grade downward to get trains deep enough under Penn, so it would likely result in the need for more property acquisition than the southward expansion.
 - The federal NEPA review requires an Alternatives Analysis that will look at all reasonable alternatives to the southward expansion.
 - Have the Railroads considered extending Tracks 1-4 to the east, south of JO interlocking?
 - Extending Tracks 1-4 to the east is challenging due to the grade upon descent required to avoid the Seventh Avenue subway. The grade that would be required exceeds the max allowable grade of 2% that NJT trains can travel downhill.
- Felicia Park-Rogers, Tri-State Transportation Campaign
 - Are additional tunnels under the East River projected to be completed in 2080?
 - Jeremy Colangelo-Bryan of NJT responded that this was a best guess, but there is nothing set in stone. The current Gateway and Penn projects are targeted to accommodate 2045 projected demand, so his 2080 estimate was based on an assumption that the next project would address capacity needs for projected demand 25-35 years after 2045.
- State Senator Hoylman
 - We need confirmation whether Penn Expansion could be built underneath the blocks south of Penn Station without demolishing existing buildings.
 - Petra acknowledged the importance of determining this and reiterated that the Railroads will confirm whether demolition of buildings will be required as part of their engineering analysis and NEPA process.
 - How do we make sure that ESD's GPP process is in line with the outcome of the federal NEPA Alternatives Analysis and review?
 - Holly Leicht explained that ESD will not pursue any actions on Sites 1, 2 & 3 (the potential Penn Expansion blocks) unless and until: i) the Railroads have advanced the plan to expand to those sites after conducting their Alternatives Analysis; ii) those sites are selected as the preferred alternative in the federal review process; and iii) the plan to expand to those sites has been fully evaluated and approved through a completed federal environmental review under NEPA.
 - The GPP sets a framework for the development of Sites 1, 2 & 3 in the event that the federal environmental review makes a determination in favor of the Penn Expansion on those sites, but unless and until that determination is made and the NEPA is completed, no action would occur on Sites 1, 2 & 3 as a result of the GPP.

- Are Sites 4 & 5 being considered as an alternative for Penn Expansion?
 - Amtrak believes that the most cost-efficient and flexible option for Penn Expansion is to expand to the south to take advantage of the future HRT connection, which will be located to the south of existing Penn Station. However, the Railroads are exploring multiple options in their Alternatives Analysis.
- EJ Kalafarski, CB5
 - What Amtrak operations will be moving into Penn Expansion?
 - Penn Expansion will be primarily used by NJT trains, while Amtrak will continue to primarily use existing Penn Station and Moynihan Train Hall.
 - Is the primary goal of Gateway to rehabilitate existing tunnels and to support high speed rail capacity?
 - The primary focus of Gateway is to bring existing rail infrastructure to a state of good repair and increase capacity for commuter and intercity services. Amtrak's efforts at expanding its high-speed rail service is primarily done through the introduction of new Acela trainsets that will be phased in later in 2021, additional frequencies in the off-peak, and curve modifications to allow higher speeds on the NEC. For more information, please see the Federal Railroad Administration's (FRA) "[NEC Future Tier I Environmental Impact Statement](#)."
 - Who is the market for Amtrak service to Long Island?
 - Amtrak market analysis suggests that there is a customer base in Long Island that would like to travel to NEC destinations without having to change trains at Penn Station.
- Paul Devlin, CB4
 - Will Sites 4, 5, 6, 7, and 8 be able to proceed with construction before any determination is made on Sites 1, 2 and 3?
 - Yes, ESD has determined that development of Sites 4-8 has independent utility regardless of the outcome of Sites 1-3. Any financial revenues from the development of Sites 4, 5, 6, 7 & 8 would go towards the reconstruction and/or expansion of Penn Station and the transit and public realm improvements outlined in the draft GPP.
- Elizabeth Goldstein, MAS
 - Following upon on Senator Hoylman's comments, we need to better understand the depths of the tracks and building foundations on the proposed Penn Expansion blocks to know whether demolition of those blocks is necessary for expansion. We also need to understand all of the options under consideration and whether any options were prematurely eliminated. This affects decisions about the public realm, historic resources, and the integration of the existing and new station.
 - Petra Messick again acknowledged the importance of understanding this and reiterated that the Railroads will hire a design engineering consultant to analyze this information. No options have yet been eliminated as the NEPA process has not yet begun.
 - Are there stations in other parts of the world that might provide a model of how to successfully integrate stations in ways the Railroads haven't looked at?
 - Petra Messick emphasized that no options for Penn Expansion have been ruled out, and many alternatives have been and continue to be studied.
 - If the southern expansion goes forward, who will own the blocks and what implications will that have on who will drive development of those blocks?
 - At this time, it is not yet determined whether Amtrak, MTA, and/or ESD would undertake the acquisition of properties for the Penn Expansion. However, it is likely that ultimately, ESD would hold title to the properties and issue one or more Requests for Proposals for development of them.
 - Where will the revenues from the blocks south of Penn Station go?
 - All revenue from the development of the blocks south of Penn Station would go towards Penn Expansion and Penn Reconstruction.

- How do we ensure that there is common planning across all the blocks south of Penn Station to ensure a coherent public realm and neighborhood?
 - ESD is very focused on the holistic plans for the entire Penn Station area and has involved City Planning and other agencies in discussions to ensure a cohesive planning vision for the area.
- Layla Law-Gisiko, CB5
 - What is the role of the GDC and how does the GDC interact with ESD's GPP process?
 - The GDC is empowered by New York and New Jersey legislation to deliver the Hudson Tunnel Project and other Gateway projects, each of which requires an MOU among the States and any other parties involved.
 - There is no direct connection between the GDC and ESD.
 - What type of financial decisions can the GDC make? Can the GDC spend money?
 - The GDC is a public authority and can receive federal grants and loans.
 - Does the GDC need the state legislatures' approval for decisions?
 - New York and New Jersey each have three commissioners on the GDC, and Amtrak has one commissioner. The GDC is empowered to make decisions on its own, but all the commissioners must come to an agreement in order to authorize a decision.
 - Is the GDC involved with Penn Reconstruction or Penn Expansion?
 - At this time, the GDC is solely focused on the Hudson Tunnel Project. It may become involved with the Penn Expansion project in the future.
 - Is the NEPA process or the GPP the final determinant for the Penn Expansion project?
 - Any plan for Penn Expansion will need to be permitted and approved by the federal NEPA process, so that is the final determiner of whether the expansion will happen on those sites.
 - Would ESD consider excluding Sites 1, 2 & 3 from the current GPP until the NEPA concludes and perhaps create a separate GPP for Sites 1, 2 & 3?
 - New York State believes it is critical to include Sites 1, 2 & 3 in the GPP for several reasons. First, the federal transportation agencies will look to see how developed the plan for expansion is and will require a committed funding stream for the local match. The GPP will allow for a realistic financing framework for the Penn Station projects in the timeframe that is necessary for Penn Expansion to be ready when the HRT is completed. Secondly, as stated earlier, ESD is focused on producing a comprehensive plan for this area to ensure a cohesive public realm and urban design approach.
 - Would ESD issue bonds against PILOT generated by Sites 1, 2 & 3?
 - ESD or another public entity may potentially issue bonds against future PILOT revenues if Penn Expansion moves forward.
 - Further discussion of potential financing mechanisms will take place at CACWG Meeting #5.
 - Will the federal authorities be comfortable with uncertainty in financing Penn Expansion?
 - When the NEPA review is complete, if Sites 1-3 are selected for the expansion, the financing plan would be further defined and presented to the federal agencies with known funding sources.
 - Is there an opportunity to create the Penn Expansion under Blocks 807, 808 and 809?
 - See previous answer on Block 807 in response to Dario Quinsac's question.
 - Are there existing tracks underneath Blocks 807, 808 and 809?
 - Peter Matusewitch confirmed that other than the corner of Block 807, there are no tracks directly underneath those blocks. The tracks underneath adjoining blocks connect to the ERT and Sunnyside Yards. Creating a station there would reduce capacity and throughput that Amtrak, MTA and NJT currently have.
 - Why is it possible to connect to Grand Central at 150 feet below grade but not at Penn Station?

- East Side Access is essentially creating an entirely new station underneath Grand Central that does not require connection to current GCT service. The Gateway program is designed to connect with the Penn Expansion at the elevation of the existing tracks to meet two goals: allowing for integration with existing Penn so that service is not disrupted while the NRT is being repaired, and increasing overall rail capacity at Penn. It is essential that the two stations connect at the same level and are totally integrated to achieve both of these goals.
- Felicia Park-Rogers
 - Have you looked at reconfiguring existing Penn Station and rebuilding tracks and widening platforms at existing Penn Station to allow for through-running? Is it possible to do a cost-benefit analysis of through-running at existing Penn Station compared to Penn Expansion?
 - Amtrak does not view through-running as a capacity solution for Penn Station. It is a way to connect different markets and regions, but it does not add tracks or increase train capacity.
 - Amtrak would not consider rebuilding tracks and widening existing platforms for multiple reasons. First, there would be an unacceptable level of disruption to existing commuter and intercity services that access Penn Station. In addition, the resulting trips on alternative modes to get into Manhattan – including the road network, PATH, subways and ferries – would cause significant economic costs, access to work challenges, air pollution, and safety impacts in New York and New Jersey. Finally, this approach is unlikely to create the full capacity increase that is needed in any case.
- Robert Atturbury, Congressman Nadler
 - How does the decision-making for the Penn Expansion, the Penn Station Master Plan and the GPP interact? For example, will a decision in the GPP about a pedestrian pathway impact plans for Penn Expansion?
 - Decisions about Penn Expansion and Penn Reconstruction and those for surrounding transit system and the surrounding area will support each other. In response to the above example, a decision about a pedestrian pathway in the GPP is not going to drive a Penn Expansion alternative selection decision. The Railroads and ESD are coordinating closely, and decisions are being informed by each other.
 - Can you also talk about the status of the Penn Reconstruction decisions?
 - Penn Reconstruction is still in the Planning phase and will be further discussed in CACWG Meeting #4.
 - Holly Leicht explained that ESD and the Railroads have been looking at the Penn Projects and the GPP's public realm and transit improvements holistically to ensure cohesiveness and to ensure that improvements such as a pedestrian network outside of the Penn Station footprint are in the right locations. In addition, some portions of a new pedestrian network will go through basements of buildings that would be built as part of the GPP, underscoring the need for the GPP and Penn projects to be planned hand in hand.
- Tokumbo Shobowale, The New School
 - Does the new HRT access all of the existing tracks at Penn Station?
 - The new HRT will access the center and southern tracks of Penn Station and will fan out to 8 or 9 or more new tracks at Penn Expansion.
 - Will the NRT access Penn Expansion?
 - It is possible that the NRT will access some of the new tracks at Penn Expansion, but this will depend on how the Penn Expansion station is designed.
 - How important is it to ensure that both old and new tracks at Penn Expansion are linked with each other in providing rail service reliability, on-time operations and redundancy?
 - Connecting existing tracks with future tracks is a desired goal for achieving the best level of rail service but needs to be analyzed further during the planning and design process.

Item #	Description / Discussion
--------	--------------------------

- It would be helpful to have a visualization of the systems, tracks and elevations.
 - Petra Messick will provide an updated presentation with a Penn Station track map to upload to Huddle.
- Basha Gerhards, REBNY (via Zoom chat)
 - Can we have visuals that tie together the different presentations and how the different infrastructure projects tie together, or don't, because of existing sub-grade conditions?
- Christine Berthet, CB 4 (via Zoom chat)
 - If Amtrak trains use the existing station and proceed to the East River, why could not those tunnels be expanded?
 - Why would the new tracks not connect to the LIRR tracks?

14. POST-MEETING Q&A

- Christine Berthet, CB 4
 - The current Amtrak trains continue to the east side and then north; what is preventing the Gateway tracks from following the same path?
 - The new Gateway tracks, if positioned south of existing Penn Station, could not physically make the tight, 90-degree turn that would be required to enter the East River Tunnel portals to Lines 1 and 2. Even if they could, Lines 1 and 2 are at or near capacity in peak hours, and adding additional trains would degrade existing service as opposed to increasing capacity.
 - The Long island railroad tracks come from the East side. What is preventing the Gateway tracks from connecting with them or following the same path?
 - LIRR trains primarily use Amtrak's East River Tunnel Lines 3 and 4 to access Penn Station. These are the two northernmost East River Tunnel tracks, located the furthest from where the Hudson River Tunnels will enter Manhattan south of Penn Station. A direct connection cannot be made from the Penn South tracks to Lines 3 and 4, located at the northeast side of Penn Station, while maintaining acceptable maximum track curves. In addition, Lines 3 and 4 of the East River Tunnel are already at or near capacity for the LIRR existing schedule.
 - Even if, theoretically, a train from the new Hudson River Tunnel could enter Penn Station from the south, and through a series of diagonal moves could cross the entire station to enter the East River Tunnel, this would so disrupt and conflict with scheduled trains, causing delays and reducing the amount of trains that currently use Penn Station, it would reduce rather than increase capacity.
 - What prevents the new tracks from connecting to the upper Long Island Railroad tracks?
 - The new Hudson River Tunnel will connect to Tracks 1-18 at Penn Station, including Tracks 13-18, which are regularly used by LIRR. The only tracks it cannot reach are 19-21, which are exclusively used by LIRR.