

**EMPIRE STATION  
COMMUNITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE WORKING GROUP**
**DATE/TIME: April 27, 2021 / 4:00pm EST**
**WEEK #: 1**
**SUBJECT: Introductory Meeting**
**MEETING LEADER: ESD**
**PARTICIPANTS:**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>ORGANIZATION / AGENCY</b>	<b>NAME</b>	<b>ORGANIZATION / AGENCY</b>
Hon. Jerrold Nadler	U.S. House of Representatives	Layla Law-Gisiko	Community Board 5
Hon. Brad Hoylman	New York State Senate	EJ Kalafarski	Community Board 5
Hon. Gale Brewer	Manhattan Borough President	Clayton Smith	Community Board 5
Robert Atterbury	U.S. Congressman Jerrold Nadler	Felicia Park-Rogers	Tri-State Transportation Campaign
Robert Gottheim	U.S. Congressman Jerrold Nadler	Santos Rodriguez	Building & Construction Trades Council of NY
Shelby Garner	U.S. Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney	Tokumbo Shobowale	New School
Betsy Schmid	U.S. Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney	Eugene Sinigalliano	Resident Representative
Johanna Garcia	NYS Senator Robert Jackson	Marilyn Taylor	University of Pennsylvania
Dario Quinsac	NYS Senator Robert Jackson	Jessica Walker	Manhattan Chamber of Commerce
Jacob Priley	NYS Senator Brad Hoylman	Tom Wright	Regional Plan Association
Maia Berlow	NYS Senator Brad Hoylman	Robert Paley	MTA
Matt Tighe	NYS Assemblyman Richard Gottfried	William Schwartz	MTA
Wendi Paster	NYS Assemblyman Richard Gottfried	Peter Matusewitch	MTA
Matt Washington	Manhattan Borough President's Office	Petra Messick	Amtrak
Lizette Chaparro	Manhattan Borough President's Office	Sharon Tepper	Amtrak
Laurie Hardjowirogo	New York City Council	Edward Pincar	NYC DOT
Raju Mann	New York City Council	Josh Krauss	NYC DOT
Andrew Lassiter	New York City Council	Jennifer Sta. Ines	NYC DOT
Carl Wilson	New York City Council	Edith Hsu-Chen	NYC Dept of Planning
Louis Bailey	WE ACT for Environmental Justice	Judy Kessler	Vornado
Dan Biederman	34th Street Partnership	Carl Weisbrod	Vornado (consultant)
Dan Pisark	34 <sup>th</sup> Street Partnership	John Schuyler	FX Collaborative
Kevin Finnegan	Labor lawyer, formerly 1199	Toby Snyder	FX Collaborative
Marrissa Williams	32BJ	Amy Shell	FX Collaborative
Fred Cerullo	Grand Central Partnership	Deniz Onder	FX Collaborative
Julia Campanelli	Hell's Kitchen Block Association	Holly Leicht	ESD
Brook Jackson	Partnership for New York City	Gabriella Green	ESD
Elizabeth Goldstein	The Municipal Art Society of NY	Marion Phillips	ESD
Christine Berthet	Community Board 4	Rachel Shatz	ESD
Lowell Kern	Community Board 4	Phil Maguire	ESD
Paul Devlin	Community Board 4	Terence Cho	ESD
Jeffrey LeFrancois	Community Board 4	Angel Santana	ESD
Vikki Barbero	Community Board 5	Anabel Frias	ESD

**NAME**  
Simonida Subotic

**ORGANIZATION / AGENCY**  
ESD

**NAME**

**ORGANIZATION / AGENCY**

Unidentified Participants: JEB

**Location:** Zoom

The following minutes prepared by Empire State Development are a summary of the meeting and are intended to capture only the main points made in the meeting. Discrepancies should be reported to Gabriella Green at Empire State Development within three (3) calendar days of distribution of this document.

<b>Item #</b>	<b>Description / Discussion</b>
<b>1.</b>	<b><u>CACWG INTRODUCTION, STRUCTURE, PURPOSE AND GOALS</u></b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Introduction by Gabriella Green, facilitator for CACWG, who explained structure, purpose and goals of CACWG</li><li>• Meetings will take place on Tuesdays, 4 – 6pm for twelve weeks and will cover topics compiled in consultation with electeds and Community Board 4 and 5 leadership.</li><li>• Purpose and Goals (per electeds and CB leadership):<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>➤ Surface and try to resolve obstacles to an improved and cohesive Penn Station and Penn District.</li><li>➤ Develop a set of recommendations for ESD on next steps for the GPP and provide feedback to MTA/Amtrak/NJT through their ongoing Penn Station planning process.</li><li>➤ Report with recommendations to ESD to create and achieve shared goals</li><li>➤ Possible Community Board meeting(s) on CACWG work during process or after report is done</li></ul></li></ul>
<b>2.</b>	<b><u>PENN STATION PROJECT PURPOSE AND GOALS</u></b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Introduction by Peter Matusewitch, VP at MTA Construction and Development, of Penn Reconstruction and Penn Expansion projects, part of the Penn Master Plan and a partnership among MTA, NJ Transit, Amtrak with services provided by WSP and FX Collaborative</li><li>• Penn Reconstruction and Penn Expansion to be integrated with Moynihan Train Hall and each other<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>➤ Penn Reconstruction<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Addresses safety and security issues related to pedestrian flow, overcrowded platforms and station operations</li><li>○ Creates clear street presence, introduces daylighting, and improves passenger experience</li></ul></li><li>➤ Penn Expansion<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Designed to meet expected short-term ridership increase of 40% by 2028</li><li>○ Accommodate increased through-running in the future</li></ul></li></ul></li></ul>
<b>3.</b>	<b><u>GPP PURPOSE AND GOALS</u></b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Introduction by Holly Leicht, EVP at ESD Real Estate, of GPP project</li><li>• GPP project is independent from but related to railroad projects. Throughout GPP process, ESD has been in coordination with railroads, particularly the MTA, which has shaped the GPP transit improvements.</li><li>• The area around Penn Station is the right place in New York City to plan for future growth because of the area’s unparalleled local and regional transportation assets and relative underdevelopment, which collectively present an opportunity to create a modern, transit-oriented mixed-use district.<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>➤ Develop a comprehensive plan to catalyze transit-oriented, mixed-use redevelopment and enhance the public realm around Penn Station, the largest transportation hub in North America</li><li>➤ Foster economic growth and tax revenues through the creation of jobs and economic activity during construction, and through the provision of modern commercial office space (e.g., more generous column spacing, larger ceiling heights, upgraded mechanical systems) and new mixed-income housing to accommodate New York City’s long-term growth</li></ul></li></ul>

Item #	Description / Discussion
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Support the reconstruction and expansion of Penn Station through an integrated network of at- and below-grade transit and pedestrian improvements</li> <li>➤ Establish a framework to generate revenue for the reconstruction and expansion of Penn Station and other transit and public realm improvements</li> </ul>
<b>4.</b>	<b><u>BIGGER PICTURE PROJECT SCHEDULE</u></b>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Outline of schedules (subject to change) for Hudson Tunnel Project, Penn Reconstruction &amp; Expansion, and GPP project and links among these projects</li> <li>• Urgent timing of Penn projects and GPP project is driven by need to be ready for completion of Hudson River Tunnels in 2030, as well as this moment in time when politics are aligned in Washington for federal funding.</li> <li>• Current dates shown for Penn projects are dates used in GPP DEIS that were agreed to by ESD and the three railroads when the GPP process started last year. They are ambitious and may change but respond to the Hudson River Tunnels deadline.</li> </ul>
<b>5.</b>	<b><u>PROJECT INTEGRATION</u></b>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ESD working with railroads to support increased capacity at Penn and resulting increased pedestrian flows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Widening of platforms</li> <li>➤ Increased or upgraded ADA accessibility</li> <li>➤ Below-grade pedestrian network from Penn to Herald Square and north to 34<sup>th</sup> Street</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
<b>6.</b>	<b><u>ESD STATUTORY AUTHORITY</u></b>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ESD’s authority is laid out in the 1968 Urban Development Corporation Act (or “UDC Act”) and was created to help expedite ambitious projects. Several statutory categories of projects, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Land Use Improvement Project</li> <li>➤ Civic Project</li> </ul> </li> <li>• ESC is classified as both a Land Use Improvement and Civic Project.</li> <li>• ESD can: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Acquire, encumber and dispose of any real property interest (including by eminent domain). <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Note: ESD will not make findings for eminent domain in this approvals process.</li> </ul> </li> <li>➤ Offer tax abatements via “Payment in Lieu of Tax” (PILOT) agreements and is exempt from NYS and municipal taxes</li> <li>➤ Override local zoning, subject to SEQRA, through project “Design, Use and Occupancy” Guidelines in lieu of zoning in consultation with local municipality</li> <li>➤ Issue bonds for a “private project,” with interest exempt from income tax (requires legislative authorization)</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
<b>7.</b>	<b><u>GPP PROCESS</u></b>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• GPP process typically takes ~18 months <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ ESC is at about month 12 with release of DEIS and draft GPP, but public hearing has been postponed for CACWG meetings</li> <li>➤ Developers for Sites 1-3, should those sites get redeveloped as part of the Penn expansion project, would be selected through one or more future RFPs. Likely there will be modifications to the GPP once there are developers and proposals for those sites.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
<b>8.</b>	<b><u>Q&amp;A AND COMMENTS</u></b>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• BP Brewer <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ How much funding is needed for Penn? Can we back into density based on amount of funding needed? Is all the above-ground development necessary given other sources of funding?</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

- Can we have more specifics on layout of station?
  - Future presentations and meetings will address these questions.
- Paul Devlin
  - Does the 40% increased ridership projection include the population in the new office development? What is the ridership growth projection without the new office development population?
    - The 40% ridership growth projection does include the new office development. More detail on projections in future meetings. Also note: there will not be 20 million gsf of additional density; draft GPP about doubles current allowable gross square feet.
  - Glad to see housing and mixed use are in the GPP goals
  - Would like CACWG to consider the “public realm” as going beyond the project area borders
  - What is the current tax revenue generated by the GPP sites versus the revenue that would be generated by the PILOT with the increased density, and how would those funds be used?
- Christine Berthet
  - How do people get to the station and navigate it?
  - Timing needs to be reconciled – resources that might be lost on the expansion blocks should be considered for replacement in earlier buildings on the north and eastern sites
- Tokumbo Shobowale
  - How can the CACWG play a role in integrating all the projects?
  - Project is a once in a generation opportunity, and CACWG should think long term and build in flexibility for the future.
- Louis Bailey
  - Will there be a single CACWG report, or are there separate reports for above and below grade?
  - Why is through-running not being considered more?
    - Through-running will be discussed in future meeting
- Layla Law-Gisiko
  - Agrees that long-term thinking and flexibility are critical, which is why relocation of MSG should be considered in the GPP – understands from Tom Wright that time is of the essence to do something for Penn now, but it shouldn’t preclude relocation of MSG in later phase.
  - How will CACWG work inform railroads’ environmental review process and vice-versa?
  - Who will do eminent domain for expansion?
    - Not yet determined what entity will acquire the expansion blocks (e.g., could be Amtrak, MTA or ESD) – the location of the expansion needs to be confirmed through the NEPA, as well as process for moving forward.
- EJ Kalafarski
  - Need to understand the interconnectedness of this with other projects (e.g., PABT)
  - What alternatives were assessed and rejected (e.g., MSG, expansion locations)?
- Paul Devlin
  - Channeling Betty McIntosh, “Penn South” is an existing residential development – need another name for the expansion.
    - No official name has been assigned but will use “Penn Expansion” for now.
- Julia Campanelli
  - Will there be consideration in the GPP for the homeless population in the Penn Station area? The homeless are part of our community.
- Elizabeth Goldstein
  - Need to understand connections beyond the project area (MAS worked on the Garment District and is interested in relationship there.)

Item #	Description / Discussion
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Would like consideration given to moving up Meeting 9 on uses to an earlier week – what type of community are we building?               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Steering Committee will discuss this feedback. Order of sessions is not set in stone.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Robert Atterbury           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Many topics are related to each other and CACWG should be prepared to revisit past topics</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Eugene Sinigalliano           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Residents have not been kept informed of future plans and are largely in the dark. There needs to be better communication, especially regarding timing.               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ ESD reached out to building owners, but not to tenants. ESD will work with electeds, community boards and CACWG resident representatives to develop a communication strategy to better inform residential and commercial tenants on Penn Expansion blocks.</li> </ul> </li> <li>➤ Process must be transparent and accurate – e.g., Neighborhood Conditions Study had outdated pictures not reflecting recent renovations of his building, showing the building in poor condition.</li> <li>➤ Historic buildings must be fully evaluated to determine necessity of demolition.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Senator Hoylman           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Receiving inquiries from residents and commercial tenants who are trying to decide whether to renew leases and need more information on future plans and timing.               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ ESD will develop a one-pager and work with electeds, community boards and CACWG resident representatives to develop a communication strategy to better inform residential and commercial tenants on Penn Expansion blocks.</li> </ul> </li> <li>➤ Is there an analysis of historic resources in the Penn area?               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Historic resources and potential mitigation are identified in the GPP DEIS, and a more in-depth analysis will be done as part of the NEPA.</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Felicia Park-Rogers           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Have changes in ridership trends post-COVID and new opportunities for federal funding given the infrastructure bill been factored into the project?</li> <li>➤ Would like CACWG to further consider through-running</li> <li>➤ Should plans such as acquisition of Hulu Theatre or relocation of MSG or inclusion of block 807 be reconsidered in light of increased federal funding opportunities?</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Marilyn Taylor           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Can CACWG have access to FX materials?               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Materials will be shared in future meetings.</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Christine Berthet           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Is the impact of the new PA Bus Terminal considered in the DEIS?</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Layla Law-Gisiko           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ What is the cost to the region of not moving MSG?</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Elizabeth Goldstein           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Will the subway stations be discussed as part of the Master Plan discussions?</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
9.	<b><u>CONFIDENTIALITY</u></b>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• All CACWG members are reminded that CACWG meetings are confidential in nature.</li> </ul>

